

**LEARNING KATHAK:
CRAFTING BODIES AND SELVES IN THE
GURU-SHISHYA PARAMPARA**

Monica Dalidowicz

**A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy**

**Department of Anthropology
Macquarie University**

February 2012

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	iv
Statement of Candidate	v
Acknowledgments	vi
List of Figures	vii
Note on Transliteration	viii

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	
LEARNING KATHAK	1
Transnational Flows, Embodied Practice	2
Place and Place-Making in the Age of the Transnational	6
Learning and the Limits of Translation	9
Theoretical Review: Practice, the Everyday World, and the Body	12
Education, Skill and Transmission of Knowledge	17
Dance and Movement Studies	19
Objectifying Tradition	23
Methodology: Apprenticeship as Field Method	24
A Fieldworker's Apprenticeship	27
The Subjectivity of Apprenticeship	30
Outline of the Dissertation	34

CHAPTER TWO: HISTORY OF A KATHAKA:	
A TRANSNATIONAL LINEAGE	36
First Encounters	36
Transcultural Roots: From Kathakas to Courtesans	37
Connections to Bai Culture	39
Bhakti Devotion in Kathak	42
The Renaissance and the Rise of Nationalism	43
Refashioning Kathak: the Post-Independence Nationalist Agenda	47
India in the ‘West’	48
New Audiences, New Learners	49
An Emerging Indian Diaspora	53
Re-exporting Tradition: Return Flows to India	54
30-year Anniversary	55
Modernised Guru-Shishya: ‘A Modern-Guru in Training’	58

CHAPTER THREE: TRANSLATING GURU-NESS IN PRACTICE: A ‘MODERN-GURU IN TRAINING’	60
The Metaphysics of Guru-ness	61
Misinterpreting Guru-ness	65
The Lived World: On Becoming and Being a Guru	69
The Emotional Dimension of Guru-Shishya	74

CHAPTER FOUR: PLACE MATTERS:	
THE EXPERIENCE OF GURUKUL	81
Suspended Moments of Gurukul: India	82
The Being-in-Place Kolkata	84
Sadvyavhar aur Tehzeeb: Attitude and Etiquette	87
Learning the Rules of the Games: Mistakes and Misfires	96
Ruptures in Place World	99
 CHAPTER FIVE: PLACE-MAKING AND TRANSNATIONALISM	
AND IN THE INDIAN DIASPORA	101
Transporting Place	102
A Place in the Diaspora: Creating Distinction	114
 CHAPTER SIX: THE WIDER ECOLOGY OF THE GURU-SHISHYA	
RELATIONSHIP THE COMMUNITY OF SENIOR STUDENTS	122
The Primacy of Participation: Situated Learning	123
The Community of Practice: The Hierarchy of Students	125
A Decentralised Network: The Workings of the Consortium	132
Enculturation into Chhandam: the ‘Di-dis’ of Chhandam	135
Consensual Authority: Systematising Knowledge	141
The Economy of the Guru-Shishya	145
Responsibility and Reputation: Positions of Privilege	150
 CHAPTER SEVEN: WAYS OF KNOWING	
THE SHARED PRODUCTION OF BODILY KNOWLEDGE	156
Understanding Transmission: Problematising Imitation	158
Scaffolding Imitation	160
The Case of Tatkar: Producing Rhythm	162
The Multi-Sensory Modes of Movement	165
Learning Tal	171
Scaffolding to Performance: The Case of Kathak Yoga	174
‘Knowing How’ and ‘Knowing That’	178
 CHAPTER EIGHT: DISCIPLINING THE BODY:	
PARAMPARIC BODIES	185
‘Practice’, Discipline and the Wider Morality of Riyaz	187
Pragmatics of ‘Practice’ vs. Riyaz	191
The Body of Habit: Discipline and Habit Formation	192
Locating Creativity	193
Learning to Improvise: Corporeal Mathematics	199
Improvisation the Case of the Sixteen Tihais	201
Cosmological ‘Realism’: Metaphysics of Union	204
Continuity and Creativity	206

CHAPTER NINE: LEARNING ABHINAYA:	
‘BECOMING THE CHARACTER’	207
Rasa, Theorised and Embodied	209
Learning Abhinaya: The Basics of Gat Bhao	212
Learning from the Everyday: But from Whose Everyday	219
Being Sita: Essential Indian-ness or Universalism?	224
Invisible Authority and Self-Interrogation: the Production of Sita Haran	228
‘You are the Masculine. You are the Feminine’	236
 CHAPTER TEN: CONCLUSION:	
LEARNING KATHAK, LEARNING AGENCY	239
The Traditional Kathak Solo	239
Dependency and Passionate Attachment: Dancing for the Guru	241
The Productive Nature of Discipline	245
Becoming a Kathaka: the Solo	248
Belief in the Body, Belief in the Guru	251
Going Through the Fire	255
Producing Bodily Knowledge	257
 Appendix A: Chhandam’s Nine Principles	260
Appendix B: Ethics Approval	262
References Cited	265
List of Interviews	289

ABSTRACT

Kathak dance is a north Indian dance form that integrates elements of dance, music and drama: rhythmic footwork, recitation, pirouettes, elaborate gestural movements and dramatic storytelling form part of the repertoire. Learning historically occurred within the guru-shishya parampara, the tradition of one-to-one learning between master-disciple. The shifting socio-economic circumstances of today's world make this approach difficult to sustain; universities, academies, commercial and private dance schools are slowly replacing this traditional model, both in India and abroad. The re-making of kathak is further exacerbated by the increasing and ongoing flow of teachers, students, images and ideas as they travel between India and its many diasporic locations. This dissertation is an ethnographic study of one such transnational lineage of dancers, based between India and America, who continue to subscribe to a re-created version of the guru-shishya parampara.

This is an ethnography of learning and apprenticeship in kathak dance. My research is based on two and a half years of fieldwork under the tutelage of Pandit Chitresh Das and the larger community of dancers in Kolkata and the San Francisco Bay area, the two main locations of his lineage. I take the guru-shishya relationship as the grounding for practitioners' experience of the dance, for it is only through study with the guru that one can participate in the lineage's idealised way of life of the kathaka. I address the hierarchical nature of guru-shishya, a relationship based on ideals of surrendering, submission and discipline, with a description of the slow temporality of the process, the productive nature of discipline, and the expanded sense of agency that is the long term goal of such learning relationships.

Place-making has become a salient feature of existence in the Indian diaspora, brought about by the migrations and movements of people between India and America. Through a study of learning kathak, I consider the experiences of place-making and the limits to which entire 'places' can be moved. I consider the importance of the spatial located-ness of practice, and of place as a materialised site of practice, where people move, emote and relate to one another in particular ways. I also consider the potentiality of flows and the transformations of transnationalism, as well as of its limits.

Statement of Candidate

I certify that the work in this thesis entitled “**Learning Kathak: Crafting Bodies and Selves in the Guru-Shishya Parampara**” has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree to any other university or institution other than Macquarie University.

I also certify that the thesis is an original piece of research and it has been written by me. Any help and assistance that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been appropriately acknowledged.

In addition, I certify that all information source and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

The research presented in this thesis was approved by the Macquarie University Ethics Review Committee, reference number: **HE23Nov2007-D05562** on **December 14, 2007**.

Monica Dalidowicz
41187830

August 2011

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am, above all, grateful to Pandit Chitresh Das and the entire community of Chhandam dancers in both the San Francisco Bay area and Kolkata. I am deeply thankful for the world Pandit-ji and all the dancers of Chhandam so generously and whole-heartedly opened up to and shared with me. Like the dancers I have written about, my own learning and experiences with Das have transformed my own life in ways that I am only beginning to understand. In the spirit of the dance, I offer my deep namaskar to Pandit-ji.

I am also grateful to my dissertation committee. To my supervisor, Dr. Kalpana Ram, I have been very fortunate to have a supervisor with whom I could share my love of dance. I thank you for your incredible support and patience and for helping me to see more deeply into the wonderful nuances and subtleties, not only of Indian dance, but also of the anthropological tradition. Many thanks to Dr. Greg Downey for your helpful comments and support, and for being one of my first motivations to take seriously the anthropological study of movement and dance. My deepest gratitude also to Dr. Peter Gose, who was the reason I first pursued anthropology and who is still a source of inspiration for much of what I have done since.

To my family, to my mother, Kathy Halbich, to Michelle and to Frede – thank you for your incredible belief in all I set out to do. Your support and faith – that I will always succeed, no matter what – is always with me, no matter how near or far we are from one another.

I also extend my gratitude to Macquarie University and the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC) for their financial support. Research and writing were supported by a Macquarie University Research Excellence Scholarship (2007-2011) and a SSHRC Doctoral Fellowship (2007-2011).

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1	Photos of the Great Gurus	38
Figure 2	Pandit Das at Age nine, with Pandit Samta Prasad and Pandit Ram Narayan Misra, Kolkata	45
Figure 3	Nritya Bharati Dance School, Kolkata	46
Figure 4	Nritya Bharati, with Rukmini Devi, Srimati Nilima Das and Young Chitresh Das	46
Figure 5	Pandit Das giving a lecture demonstration at the University of Maryland	49
Figure 6	Pandit Das and Company, First Tour of India	52
Figure 7	Pandit Das and students at Ramayana school show, CA	56
Figure 8	Pandit Das and students at Kathak retreat, CA	106
Figure 9	The Altar as set up at the kathak retreat	108
Figure 10	Pandit Das lighting altar at the Ghungru Ceremony, CA	108
Figure 11	Pandit Das teaching in Kolkata	110
Figure 12	Students performing Pranam, CA	111
Figure 13	Chhandam School Flyer	126
Figure 14	Chitresh Das Dance Company in 'Sampurnam', CA	128
Figure 15	Pandit Das with student at Ghungru Ceremony, CA	139
Figure 16	Pandit Das teaching in Kolkata	161
Figure 17	Students in Kolkata	163
Figure 18	Pandit Das leads students in recitation, Kolkata	168
Figure 19	Pandit Das assists dancer, Kolkata	170
Figure 20	Pandit Das depicting Rati	217
Figure 21	Flyer for 'Sita Haran'	230
Figure 22	'Sita Haran' with Anjali Nath and Charlotte Moraga	233
Figure 23	'Sita Haran' with Charlotte Moraga, Labonee Mohanta and Anjali Nath	233

NOTE ON TRANSLITERATION

I use English transliterations for all Hindi, Bengali and Sanskrit terms within this dissertation. I have relied on the transliterations in written materials published and provided by the dance school and teachers with whom I studied and researched. Many of the transliterations are thus, anglicised versions of the Hindi, Bengali or Sanskrit terms.