

Reporting Armistice: A diachronic, functional perspective

Claire Emily Scott

BA (Hons) (Macquarie University)

This thesis is presented for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Department of Linguistics
Faculty of Human Sciences
Macquarie University
Sydney, Australia

September 2009

Table of Contents

Table of Contents.....	ii
List of Tables	vi
List of Figures.....	vii
List of Figures.....	vii
Abstract.....	ix
Statement of Candidate.....	x
Acknowledgements.....	xi
Chapter 1.....	1
1 Towards a diachronic, functional account of language in context.....	1
1.1 Introduction to the thesis.....	1
1.1.1 Objectives of the thesis	2
1.2 Introduction to the data	3
1.3 Approach to language in context in the thesis.....	6
1.3.1 Register.....	8
1.4 Relevant issues from media studies and media history	8
1.4.1 The function and content of news and news organisations	9
1.4.2 The role of the journalist.....	10
1.4.3 The role of technology in news production	12
1.5 Thesis questions.....	12
1.6 Structure of the thesis.....	13
1.7 Conclusion	14
Chapter 2.....	15
2 Literature Review	15
2.1 General introduction and overview of the chapter	15
2.2 Traditions of media discourse analysis	15
2.2.1 Historical accounts of news media	16
2.2.2 Approaches to studying the news media.....	17
2.2.2.1 War in the media, armistice in the media.....	19
2.3 A theoretical framework for register analysis: Systemic Functional Linguistics....	21
2.3.1 Problematising ‘register’	22
2.3.1.1 Instantiation	22
2.3.1.2 Stratification	24
2.3.1.3 Metafunction	29
2.3.1.4 Semogenesis.....	31
2.3.2 Operationalising ‘register’.....	32
2.3.2.1 Locating the analysis in a register framework	33
2.4 Conclusion to chapter	35
Chapter 3.....	36
3 Reporting armistice in a changing culture.....	36
3.1 General introduction and overview of the chapter	36
3.2 Overview of the ‘corpus’	38
3.2.1 Access to data.....	38
3.2.2 Corpus size.....	38
3.2.3 Historical overview	39
3.2.3.1 The human impact of war	39
3.2.3.2 The media landscape	40
3.2.3.3 <i>Sydney Morning Herald</i> Circulation.....	40
3.3 Boer War text (3 rd June, 1902).....	42

3.3.1	The presentation of the text.....	42
3.3.2	The culture of war.....	44
3.3.3	The media culture	46
3.4	World War I text (12 th November, 1918).....	47
3.4.1	The presentation of the text.....	48
3.4.2	The culture of war.....	49
3.4.3	The media culture	50
3.5	World War II text (16 th August, 1945).....	52
3.5.1	The presentation of the text.....	52
3.5.2	The culture of war.....	53
3.5.3	The media culture	54
3.6	Korean War text (28 th July, 1953).....	55
3.6.1	The presentation of the text.....	56
3.6.2	The culture of war.....	57
3.6.3	The media culture	59
3.7	Vietnam War text (1 st May, 1975).....	59
3.7.1	The presentation of the text.....	60
3.7.2	The culture of war.....	61
3.7.3	The media culture	62
3.8	Gulf War text (1 st March, 1991).....	63
3.8.1	The presentation of the text.....	64
3.8.2	The culture of war.....	65
3.8.3	The media culture	66
3.9	Iraq War text (10 th April, 2003).....	68
3.9.1	The presentation of the text.....	69
3.9.2	The culture of war.....	70
3.9.3	The media culture	70
3.10	Conclusion to the chapter	72
Chapter 4	73
4	The construction of time and space in armistice reporting	73
4.1	Introduction to the chapter	73
4.2	Representing time and space in English	74
4.3	Statistical comparisons of the texts	75
4.4	Construing time logically: tense	79
4.5	Construing time and space experientially.....	84
4.5.1	Circumstances of time and place.....	87
4.5.2	Towards a more delicate description of Circumstances of time and place.....	88
4.5.2.1	Circumstances of time: sub-categories	90
4.5.2.2	Realisations of sub-categories of Circumstances of Time.....	92
4.5.2.3	Circumstances of place: sub-categories	96
4.5.2.4	Realisations of sub-categories of Circumstances of Place.....	97
4.6	Thematising time and space.....	101
4.6.1	Time and space as point of departure for the clause	102
4.6.2	Time and space in point of departure for the news	106
4.7	Discussion.....	109
4.7.1	Registerial Implications.....	109
4.7.2	Implications for inferring change in the social milieu	112
4.8	Conclusion to Chapter 4.....	112
Chapter 5	113
5	Reporting armistice through external voices.....	113

5.1	Introduction to chapter	113
5.1.1	Overview of the chapter.....	114
5.2	Background to the problem.....	114
5.2.1	The function of reporting speech and ideas in the news	118
5.2.2	Realising non-authorial sourcing	119
5.3	Analysis	120
5.3.1	Use of bylines in the texts	120
5.3.2	Statistical profile of non-authorial sourcing	121
5.3.3	Projection in non-authorial sourcing.....	123
5.3.3.1	Semantic function of projection	124
5.3.3.2	Articulating and circumscribing projected material	128
5.3.4	Sources of news information.....	131
5.4	Discussion of findings.....	140
5.4.1	The role of the journalist.....	140
5.4.2	Registerial implications	142
5.5	Conclusion	142
Chapter 6	144
6	Peace and Cohesive Harmony	144
6.1	Introduction	144
6.2	Introduction to Cohesive Harmony.....	145
6.2.1	Analysing cohesive harmony.....	147
6.2.2	Methodological issues	151
6.2.2.1	Clause relations and embedding	152
6.2.2.2	Co-extension and synonymy	152
6.2.2.3	Token status and metaphor	153
6.2.2.4	Chain conjunction and disjunction.....	154
6.2.3	Quantifying cohesive harmony	155
6.3	Boer War text.....	156
6.3.1	Chain interactions	160
6.3.2	Chain length and density.....	165
6.3.3	Logogenetic patterning and structure	166
	Summary of Boer War text analysis	170
6.4	Korean War text	171
6.4.1	Chain interactions	174
6.4.2	Chain length and density.....	180
6.4.3	Logogenetic patterning and structure	181
6.4.4	Summary of Korean War text analysis	187
6.5	Iraq War text.....	188
6.5.1	Chain interactions	190
6.5.2	Chain length and density.....	194
6.5.3	Logogenetic patterning and structure	195
6.5.4	Summary of the Iraq War text analysis.....	198
6.6	Discussion.....	199
6.6.1	Field Development – Construing the ‘end of war’.....	199
6.6.2	Registerial implications of logogenetic patterning	201
6.7	Conclusion to chapter	204
Chapter 7	205
7	Shifts in Time, Shifts in Context.....	205
7.1	Introduction	205
7.1.1	Getting a grip on context.....	206

7.1.2	Using the parametric model of context as an analytical tool.....	209
7.2	The function and content of the news.....	211
7.2.1	Sphere of Action	212
7.2.2	Material Action.....	213
7.2.3	Action with Symbols	213
7.2.4	Goal Orientation	218
7.3	The role of the journalist.....	219
7.3.1	Social Hierarchy	220
7.3.2	Agentive Role.....	221
7.3.3	Social Distance.....	222
7.3.3.1	Codal Sharing: Local history and Cultural capital	224
7.3.3.2	Codally Distinct: Classification and Framing.....	231
7.3.4	Network Morphology	232
7.4	The role of technology in news production.....	232
7.4.1	Role of language.....	233
7.4.2	Medium.....	234
7.4.3	Channel.....	235
7.4.3.1	Graphic system: Modifications and additions to existing systems.....	235
7.4.3.2	Graphic system: Addition of three parallel systems	238
7.5	Discussion.....	241
7.5.1	Implications for registerial consistency and change	242
7.5.2	Implications for the investigation of historical change	248
7.6	Conclusion to the chapter	248
	Chapter Eight	250
8	Reporting Armistice: A discussion	250
8.1	Introduction	250
8.2	Answering the thesis questions.....	251
8.2.1	In these seven texts, how are the lexicogrammatical and semantic resources of English turned to the task of reporting armistice (including representing time and space, attributing information to non-authorial sources, and creating structure and texture) in relation to their context, and how has the use of the linguistic resources changed?	251
8.2.2	What does the concept of register offer to the diachronic study of text in context? What can a diachronic analysis of language in context contribute to the development of the theory of register?	254
8.2.3	What evidence can the analysis of register offer to both linguists and historians for the study of social and cultural change in the social milieu of Sydney over the period 1902 to 2003?	255
8.3	Key findings of the thesis.....	256
8.3.1	For linguistics	256
8.3.1.1	Developing theory and analytical tools	256
8.3.1.2	Problematising and modelling context.....	257
8.3.1.3	Extending the scope of the findings	260
8.3.2	For historians.....	261
8.3.3	For the general public.....	262
8.4	Conclusion	263
	References.....	265
	Appendices.....	279

List of Tables

Table 1-1 Identification of text names, dates and headlines	4
Table 2-1 Description of context according to field, tenor and mode at a primary degree of delicacy (following Hasan 1999).....	28
Table 3-1 Statistics for seven ‘end of war’ texts	39
Table 3-2 War casualty statistics for Australian military personnel.....	40
Table 3-3 Availability of modes of news dissemination 1902-2003.....	40
Table 4-1 Word, clause, and clause complex frequencies across the corpus.....	76
Table 4-2 Frequencies of Process types across the corpus and in comparison with Matthiessen's corpus	79
Table 4-3 Instances of past-in-present tense selection	83
Table 4-4 Sub-categories of Circumstances of Time	90
Table 4-5 Instances of sub-categories of Circumstances of time	92
Table 4-6 Sub-categories of Circumstances of Place	96
Table 4-7 Instances of sub-categories of Circumstances of place.....	98
Table 5-1 Attributed and quoted words in the corpus.....	122
Table 5-2 Projecting clauses in the corpus	124
Table 5-3 Types of sources in attributing news	133
Table 5-4 Occurrence in each text of Thing Types in Participant: Sayer.....	134
Table 5-5 Instances of enemy as Sayer	136
Table 6-1 Cohesive harmony statistics for Boer War, Korean War, and Iraq War texts	156
Table 6-2 Segmentation of the Boer War text in relation to coranto divisions.....	167
Table 6-3 Segments I-K from the Korean War text.....	182
Table 6-4 Text instances of interactions between Iraqi Government/Saddam Hussein/Baghdad chains and End+Control chains.....	194
Table 7-1 (Reprise of Table 2-1) Description of context according to field, tenor and mode at a primary degree of delicacy (following Hasan, 1999)	210

List of Figures

Figure 1-1 Dual perspectives on meaning: the synchronic and the diachronic.....	7
Figure 2-1 Stratificational model of language and context	25
Figure 2-2 Model of semogenesis (adapted from Butt, 2008: 70-71).....	31
Figure 2-3 Matrix of instantiation and stratification, with semogenesis added, showing conceptual location of thesis chapters (adapted from Halliday, 1995/2007: 255, 264)	34
Figure 3-1 Daily circulation figures of the <i>Sydney Morning Herald</i> at the time of the armistice reports.....	41
Figure 3-2 <i>SMH</i> circulation figures compared with Australian population growth (logarithmic scale).....	42
Figure 4-1 Statistics in relation to words, clauses, and clause complexes in each text.....	76
Figure 4-2 Comparison of ratios of words per clause and clauses per clause complex for each text	77
Figure 4-3 Distribution of Process types in each text	78
Figure 4-4 Distribution of Process types compared with Matthiessen's (1999) corpus	78
Figure 4-5 Frequencies of primary and secondary tense selections	81
Figure 4-6 Primary and secondary tense selection in free indicative temporal clauses.....	82
Figure 4-7 Circumstance types by text (delicate)	86
Figure 4-8 Comparison of Circumstances in armistice corpus and Matthiessen's (1999) corpus.....	87
Figure 4-9 Circumstances of time and place calculated in relation to total clauses.....	88
Figure 4-10 Distribution of sub-categories of Circumstances of time	91
Figure 4-11 Distribution of sub-categories of Circumstances of place	97
Figure 4-12 Circumstances of time or place as marked Theme in relation to circumstantiated clauses.....	103
Figure 4-13 Circumstance sub-categories as marked Theme	106
Figure 4-14 Comparison of Circumstances of time in opening move and whole text.....	108
Figure 4-15 Comparison of Circumstances of place in opening move and whole text.....	108
Figure 5-1 Authorial and non-authorial material in the texts (proportion of words)	123
Figure 5-2 Functions of verbal Processes.....	127
Figure 5-3 Modes of projection	129
Figure 5-4 Thing Types as Sayer	134
Figure 5-5 Allegiance of Sayers.....	135
Figure 5-6 Social role of coalition Sayers.....	137
Figure 6-1 Extract of identity chain from Boer War text	147
Figure 6-2 Extract of similarity chain from Korean War text	148
Figure 6-3 Extract of chain interactions from Boer War text.....	149
Figure 6-4 Example of token ambiguity from the Boer War text	155
Figure 6-5 Overview of Boer War text chain interactions	159
Figure 6-6 Boer War text chain interactions.....	161
Figure 6-7 Density and centrality of tokens in longest chains in the Boer War text (in increasing order of length)	166
Figure 6-8 Chain interactions in Segment I of the Boer War text	169
Figure 6-9 Logico-semantic relations between segments in the Boer War text.....	170
Figure 6-10 Overview of Korean War text chain interactions	173
Figure 6-11 Korean War text cohesive chain interactions	175
Figure 6-12 Detail of Korean War text chain interaction network showing three-way chain conjunction	177

Figure 6-13 Detail of chain conjunction and interactions from extract of the Korean War text.....	179
Figure 6-14 Density of RTs and CTs in longest chains in the Korean War text (in increasing order of length).....	181
Figure 6-15 Extract from segment G of the Korean War text.....	185
Figure 6-16 Logico-semantic relations between segments in Korean War text.....	187
Figure 6-17 Overview of Iraq War text chain interactions.....	189
Figure 6-18 Iraq War text cohesive chain interactions.....	191
Figure 6-19 Detail of interactions of individual identity chains within the Iraqis chain.....	193
Figure 6-20 Density and centrality of tokens in the longest chains in the Iraq War text (in increasing order of length).....	195
Figure 6-21 Logic-semantic relations between segments in the Iraq War text.....	198
Figure 7-1 Field Network showing areas of variation.....	243
Figure 7-2 Tenor network showing areas of variation.....	245
Figure 7-3 Mode Network showing areas of variation.....	247
Figure 8-1 Diachronic shifts in selected lexicogrammatical, semantic and contextual dimensions	253
Figure 8-2 Semiotic distance between temporally distant context of production and context of reception	259
Figure 8-3 A semogenetic view of the difference between contexts of production and reception.....	259

Abstract

This thesis presents an investigation of diachronic consistency and variation in the register of newspaper reports. The data are instances of the register from *The Sydney Morning Herald*, reporting the conclusions of seven major wars in Australia's history from 1902 to 2003: the Boer War, World War I, World War II, the Korean War, the Vietnam War, the Gulf War, and the Iraq War. The study has two primary motivations: an interest in texts that construe the social contexts of the past and what they indicate about contemporary language and culture; and an interest in exploring changes in social context and how these can be managed using current linguistic tools based on the concept of 'register'.

The research is interdisciplinary in that, as well as being a primarily linguistic enquiry, it is also an investigation of culture in history, insofar as the linguistic investigation can illuminate historical context. It is a study of the patterns of interaction between the *Herald* as an institution and the people of Sydney as its readers, and the cultural history of how Sydneysiders have experienced war and armistice through the media. Thus, as far as culture is a major part of the context of a text, this investigation addresses the problem of describing, and ascribing relevance to, contextual variables in a diachronic set of texts.

The eight chapters of the thesis present a multistratal, functional analysis of the texts as instances of register, using the framework of systemic functional linguistics (SFL). Through the analysis of context, semantics, and lexicogrammar, the thesis identifies both consistency and variation among the texts. It is argued, following Hasan (2004), that the lexicogrammatical and semantic consistency through which the texts can be identified as instances of a register is motivated by consistency in the context at a primary degree of delicacy, while variation among the texts is motivated by contextual shifts captured at greater degrees of delicacy across the strata. In particular, the analysis shows that different ways of orienting to time, space, and news information in the texts construe diachronically different contextual calibrations, particularly in relation to (1) the content and function of the news, (2) the role of the journalist, and (3) the role of technology in news production. The thesis highlights the need for further elaboration of registerial concepts and tools in order that more delicate distinctions between texts from different diachronic states might be inferred.

Statement of Candidate

I certify that the work in this thesis entitled “Reporting Armistice: A diachronic, functional perspective” has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree to any other university or institution other than Macquarie University.

I also certify that the thesis is an original piece of research and it has been written by me. Any help and assistance that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself have been appropriately acknowledged.

In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature are indicated in the thesis.

Claire Emily SCOTT

Student ID 30665221

14th September, 2009

Acknowledgements

I am so grateful to all the people who have helped me over the course of this project. I would particularly like to thank the following people:

My supervisors: David Butt, who has encouraged and inspired me all the way from first year undergraduate linguistics, and Annabelle Lukin, whose exacting standards, thoughtful questioning, and interest in the data have helped greatly in the development of a better thesis. They have both been very generous with their time and intellectual energy.

My friends in the Centre for Language in Social Life and MUPRA, whose conversations have been so valuable both for the development of ideas and the maintenance of sanity. I would especially like to acknowledge: Caroline Henderson-Brooks, for constant encouragement and gentle mentoring; Ayako Ochi, for being a gracious sharer of both ideas and office space; Rebekah Wegener, for generosity in encouragement and provision of sustenance and quirky gifts; Kathryn Tuckwell and Maria Herke, for encouragement and good advice on analysis problems; and Rhondda Fahey, for early encouragement and apprenticeship into academic life.

Many people in the Linguistics department for assistance and moral support. In particular I would like to thank Dr Wu Canzhong for technical help in relation to SysFan, and Lalana Knox for patient assistance with document recovery and storage problems.

The kind and generous media history scholars on the Australian Media History list and at the Centre for Media History, who have fielded my questions from time to time and helped me to resolve some of the media history issues pertaining to this study.

The generous friends who proof-read thesis chapters: Caroline Henderson-Brooks, Maria Herke, Jacqui Rainey, Kathryn Tuckwell, and Katelynd Turner.

My brothers and sisters at St Marks Berowra and in the Lighthouse Forum at Macquarie University, for prayers and refreshment, for always pointing me back to the One who enables, and for reminding me that intellectual and spiritual development are not mutually exclusive.

My family and friends, for supporting me and keeping me grounded in reality. I am particularly grateful to the special women who have provided the necessary mothering over the past five years.

*Dedicated to my mother,
Wendy-Anne (Mitty) Scott
(14/10/1951 – 19/03/2004),
who was my first teacher.*