UNSETTLING OPENINGS

Collaborative Environmental Management and Māori in Taranaki.

Matalena Tofa

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Geography.

Department of Environment and Geography, Macquarie University, Sydney.

December 2010

MACQUARIE UNIVERSITY

HIGHER DEGREE THESIS

AUTHOR'S CONSENT

DOCTORATE DEGREE

This is to certify that I, Matalena Rose Tofa, being a candidate for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Human Geography) am aware of the policy of the University relating to the retention and use of higher degree theses as contained in the University's Higher Degree Research Thesis Preparation, Submission and Examination Policy.

In the light of this policy, I agree to allow a copy of my thesis to be deposited in the University Library for consultation, loan and photocopying forthwith.

……..……..

Signature of Candidate

Date:

……..……..

Full Name & Signature of Witness

Date:

CONTENTS

List of Figures v
List of Tables v
List of Maps vi
Abstract vii
Acknowledgements x
Glossary of Māori Terms xi
Glossary of New Zealand English xiii
Abbreviations xiv
Units of Measurement xv
A Note about Referencing xv

Chapter One: Development, Environmental management and Taranaki 1
1.1 Taranaki and New Zealand 5
1.1.1 The Treaty, Settlements and Taranaki 10
1.2 Thesis Outline 15

Chapter Two: Postcoloniality and Indigenous Development 17
2.1 Theoretical Starting Points 18
2.1.1 Discourse and Postdevelopment 19
2.1.2 Critiques and Debates in Post-development 23
2.1.3 Postcolonial theory 27
2.2 Colonial Legacies and Postcolonial Nations 32
2.2.1 Managing Plurality in the Postcolony 34
2.2.2 Reconciling the Past, Settling the Future? 36
2.2.3 Spaces of Possibility and Risk 38
2.3 Indigenous Development in the Postcolony 39
2.3.1 Neoliberalising Development 41
2.3.2 Spatialising the Politics: Territoriality and Sovereignty 45
2.4 Conclusions 51

Chapter Three: Environmental Management, Discourse and Collaboration 53
3.1 Discourse and Environmental Management.....54
3.1.1 Defining Problems, Legitimating Interventions 54
3.1.2 Producing National Space through Management.....57
3.1.3 Assemblage, Contingency and Management.....59
3.2 Collaborative Shifts.....61
3.2.1 Debates and Dilemmas in Collaboration.....63
3.3 Collaboration, Discourse and Postcoloniality.....69
3.3.1 Continuities and Entanglements 69
3.3.2 Spatialities of Collaboration.....76
3.4 Negotiating Environmental Management 79

Chapter Four: Politics, Research and Taranaki 80
4.1 Postcolonial Anxieties in Geography.....81
4.1.1 Geographical Imaginaries and Responsibility 83
4.1.2 Learning to Work With Others 88
4.2 Doing Research in Taranaki 93
4.2.1 Methodology 97
4.2.2 Reflections on the Research Experience..... 105

Chapter Five: History, Development and Environment in Taranaki 110
5.1 Colonisation and Resistance at Taranaki 111
5.1.1 Land Acquisition 112
5.1.2 War and Confiscation: 1860-1890..... 115
5.2 Reconciliations and Settlements..... 123
5.2.1 West Coast Commissions and Reserves..... 124
5.2.2 Incomplete Reconciliations..... 129
5.2.3 Māori Development and History 132
5.3 Environmental Management and History 135
5.3.1 Regional Development and Ecological Change..... 136
5.3.2 Mount Taranaki: Focal Point of the Region..... 140
5.4 Conclusions..... 146

Chapter Six: Iwi Development and Postcoloniality in Taranaki 148
6.1 Contemporary Politics and Historical Legacies 149
6.1.1 Closure and Possibility in Treaty Settlements 150
6.1.2 Shifting Geopolitical Landscapes 156
6.2 Articulating and Building Futures 162
6.2.1 Māori Development and Settlements 162
6.2.2 Iwi Governance and Culture 165
6.2.3 Planning and Managing Development 172
6.3 Postcolonial Relationships 177
6.3.1 Crown-Māori Relations in the Treaty Settlement Era 177
6.3.2 Treaty Partnership: Negotiating the Relationship 180
6.3.3 Regional Collaboration and Strategism 184
6.4 Entanglements and Possibility in Postcolonial Spaces 188

Chapter Seven: Environmental management and Postcoloniality 189
7.1 Participating in Environmental Management in Taranaki 190
7.1.1 Values and Frameworks 192
7.1.2 Whareroa Marine Outfall 196
7.1.3 The Ability to Collaborate 201
7.2 Strategism, Learning and Relationship Building 205
7.2.1 Learning and Institutional Change 205
7.2.2 Formalising Relationships 213
7.2.3 Iwi Environmental Planning 216
7.3 Negotiating Roles and Rights 222
7.3.1 Economic Inequality and Responsibility 222
7.3.2 Invitation and Inclusion 225
7.3.3 Sovereignty and Authority in Environmental Management 227
7.4 Conclusions 234

Chapter Eight: Settlements , Water and Taranaki Maunga 235
8.1 Water: Roles, Rights and Interests 235
8.2 Taranaki Maunga: Prospects for Collaboration 246
8.3 Negotiating Settlements and Environmental Management 256

Chapter Nine: Postcoloniality and Environmental Management 257

9.1 Environmental Management, Development and Māori..... 258

9.2 Limitations and Directions for Future Research..... 265

9.3 Closures and Openings 269

Appendix A: The Treaty of Waitangi – Te Tiriti o Waitangi (1840)..... 273

Appendix B: Contemporary Treaty Settlement Notes..... 278

Appendix C: Chapter Four Notes..... 283

Appendix D: Chapter Five Notes 288

Appendix E: Chapter Six Notes..... 295

Appendix F: Chapter Seven Notes 300

Appendix G: Chapter Eight Notes 305

References..... 308

List of Figures

Figure 1: Chant for Mount Taranaki 8
Figure 2: Mount Taranaki and the Region 10
Figure 3: A multi-dimensional model of co-operative management in natural resources 66
Figure 4: Maori Anger, Pakeha Anger 95
Figure 5: Mind-Mapping about Mount Taranaki for Chapter Eight 105
Figure 6: Preparations to Invade Parihaka 123
Figure 7: Land Clearing in Taranaki 137
Figure 8: Sign on Northern side of New Plymouth 139
Figure 9: Egmont or Taranaki? 145
Figure 10: Te Pou Tutake 147
Figure 11: "Yes but won't this concept frighten the pakeha and govt [government] into leaning away from it?" 152
Figure 12: Ngāti Mutunga Governance Structure 169
Figure 13: Strategic Vision of Te Runanga o Ngāti Mutunga 175
Figure 14: Māori Relationships with the Crown 183
Figure 15: Whareroa Outfall 198
Figure 16: Diagram of the Relationship between Māori and Water (in English and Māori) 238
Figure 17: Mount Taranaki 247
Figure 18: 'Mount Taranaki, the Territory of Te Atiawa,' sign at one park entrance 252

List of Tables

Table 1: Iwi and Hapu in Taranaki 6
Table 2: Treaty Settlements in Taranaki 13
Table 3: Phases of Research 97
Table 4: Case Studies 98
Table 5: Interviewees 101
Table 6: Selected Events Relating to Land Acquisition in Taranaki 1800-1860. 112
Table 7: Conflict in Taranaki 1850-1890 116
Table 8: Steps to Confiscation. 119
Table 9: Land Acquisition in Taranaki after the Confiscations 121
Table 10: West Coast Commissions (1880-1895) 125
Table 11: Occupancy of West Coast Reserves in 1912 128
Table 12: Summary of Treaty Settlement Negotiations in Taranaki 151
Table 13: Parininihi Ki Waitotara Incorporation 161
Table 14: Local Government Agencies in Taranaki 190
Table 15: Excerpts from Relevant Legislation 192
Table 16: Boards and Committees in Taranaki 226

List of Maps

Map 1: Iwi Boundaries and Land Confiscation Boundary....9
Map 2: Confiscation Districts in Taranaki 120
Map 3: West Coast Plan of Confiscated Territory 127
Map 4: Taranaki Land District at 1902 129
Map 5: Local Government Boundaries in Taranaki 191

ABSTRACT

This thesis explores the politics of collaboration between Indigenous communities and government agencies for environmental management in the context of postcolonial Indigenous development and self-determination. Recent shifts towards participatory and collaborative models in environmental management have often proven insufficient to address justice concerns and satisfy Indigenous aspirations. However, they have allowed opportunities for relationship building and reciprocal learning. The theoretical tools of postdevelopment and postcolonial work allow a nuanced analysis of both the neocolonial limitations and the possibilities of collaboration in environmental management. From this perspective, collaboration involves sites of ongoing dialogue and transformation that reveal the fundamentally unsettled nature of postcolonial relationships and opportunities for mutuality and difference. Significantly, the politics of environmental management is inherently connected with Indigenous development and self-determination. This is not only because participation is often contingent on political and economic resources, but also because questions of historical justice and postcolonial territoriality and coexistence circle in, around and through contemporary Indigenous ambitions in environmental management.

The focus of this thesis is on how Māori *iwi* [tribes] in Taranaki, New Zealand negotiate environmental management processes while also pursuing self-determination through *iwi* development and negotiated relationships with the government. *Iwi* organisations, whose work is shaped by the legacies of colonial dispossession and goals of cultural revitalisation, seek to assert and maintain their values within, through and beyond the frameworks provided by the nation-state. This work is particularly significant in the context of 'full and final' settlements between Māori and the government for historic grievances and rights over water and Mount Taranaki. Current iterations of participatory environmental management in Taranaki tend to affirm and buttress governmental eminence by including Māori cultural concerns within pre-existing managerial processes; in effect asserting governmental sovereignty over Māori territoriality. Despite this imperfect context, increased interaction has also enabled relationship building and greater mutual understanding. Collaboration, therefore, produces unsettling openings in the complexly entangled rights, responsibilities and

relationships that shape postcolonial coexistence, revealing tensions, pluralism and mutuality across common ground.

This work has not been submitted for a higher degree to any other university or institution. The sources of information used and the extent to which the work of others has been utilised are referenced in the text. Ethics Committee approval was obtained; the approval number is: HE28NOV-D06244.

Matalena Tofa
December 2010.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This dissertation was made possible by the generosity and kindness of many people. Firstly, I wish to thank to everyone in Taranaki for generously sharing your knowledge, experiences and stories with me. He mihi nui ki a koutou. I would also like to acknowledge the extensive support and encouragement of Jamie Tuuta throughout this project.

I am extremely grateful to my supervisors Dr. Sandie Suchet-Pearson and Professor Richie Howitt. Your advice, encouragement and insights have been invaluable in this project. Thank you for your patience with my never-ending difficulty with deadlines and word limits. I also wish to thank everyone in the Department of Environment Geography at Macquarie University. It has been a privilege to learn, research and teach alongside you during my studies.

The administrative help of Meredith McGregor, Darina Nevicka and Paula Wells at Macquarie University throughout my time there is much appreciated. Thanks also to the staff at the National Archives and Taranaki Research Centre, Puke Ariki for your friendliness and assistance in tracking down records.

Finally, I would like to thank my friends and family. To Andres, Bonnie-May, Carolyn, Deirdre, Diego, Eun-Hi, Jane, Jorge, Kerstin, Kirby, Lana, Lee, Lina, Louie, Masato, Mia, Rachel and Rick – thank you for your friendship, encouragement and for all the fun times. To Phil and Sarah – thanks for all the 'tote opt mems' in Taranaki. And to my family, fa'afetai lava, alofa tele atu mo 'outou.

This research was supported by a Macquarie University Research Excellence Scholarship.

GLOSSARY OF MĀORI TERMS

Throughout this thesis Māori words are italicised (except in quotations from published sources) and translations are provided at their first usage. Below is a full list of Māori terms used in this thesis. Macrons are used to indicate a long vowel sound.

Ahi kā	(*Lit.*) Home fires; title to land through occupation.
Hapu; hapū	Sub-tribe.
Iwi	Tribe.
Kaimoana	Seafood, shell fish.
Kaitiaki	Guardian, trustee, custodian, keeper.
Kaitiakitanga	The exercise of guardianship by the *tangata whenua* of an area in accordance with *tikanga* Maori in relation to natural and physical resources; and includes the ethic of stewardship (RMA, 1991b, s2).
Kaumatua	Elder.
Kaupapa	Philosophy, cause, subject, theme.
Koro	Grandfather, grandpa; sometimes used to affectionately refer to Mount Taranaki.
Mahinga kai	Garden, cultivation.
Mana	Authority, control; prestige, power, influence, status, spiritual power, jurisdiction, mandate, freedom.
Mana whakahaere	Inherited status. Also: mana tuku iho; mana tupuna.
Mana whenua	Territorial rights, power from the land; power associated with possession and occupation of tribal land.
Marae	(*Lit).* Ground in front of the *wharenui* [meeting house]; often used to refer the buildings surrounding the *marae.*
Maunga, Mounga	Mountain. In Taranaki, 'the *maunga*' refers to Mount Taranaki.
Mauri	Life principle, source of emotions, a material symbol of a life principle.
Muru	Plunder.
Pa	Fortified village.
Pakeha; pākehā	New Zealander of European descent.

Pouwhenua	Carved wooden pole (see Chapter Five).
Rangatira	Chief.
Rangatiratanga	Chieftainship, self-determination, right to exercise authority, autonomy.
Raupatu	Confiscation.
Rohe	Boundary, district, territory, area.
Runanga	Council, board.
Takoha	Gift, token, pledge, donation (money).
Tangata whenua	(*Lit.*) People of the land; local people; hosts; Indigenous people.
Taonga	Prized possession, property.
Taueke, tauheke	Old man; sometimes used to affectionately refer to Mount Taranaki.
Te Tiriti o Waitangi	The Treaty of Waitangi.
Tikanga	Maori customary values and practices.
Tino rangatiratanga	Self-determination, sovereignty.
Tupuna	Ancestor.
Uri	Descendents.
Wāhi tapu	Sacred sites.

(Sources: RMA, 1991b, Māori Language Commission; Te Taura Whiri i te Reo Māori, 1996, Te Whanake, 2003-2010, Williams, 1997).

GLOSSARY OF NEW ZEALAND ENGLISH

Conservancy	The area a Department of Conservation (DoC) for which an office is responsible. There are 13 conservancies in New Zealand.
Conservation Board	Each conservancy has a board consisting of appointed members that oversees various planning work by the local DoC and reports to the New Zealand Conservation Authority or Director-General of Conservation.
Crown	Historically refers the British monarch; in contemporary contexts refers to the New Zealand government.
Deeds of Recognition	Oblige the Crown to consult with iwi and have regard for its views regarding the iwi's special association with a site and specifies the nature of the iwi's input into the management of those areas by the DoC and the Commissioner of Crown Lands.
Labour Party	Major centre-left party in New Zealand.
Māori	Indigenous person of New Zealand.
MP	Member of Parliament.
National Party	Major centre-right party in New Zealand.
Statutory Acknowledgement	Registers the special association of iwi with an area. Requires that consent authorities provide iwi with resource consent applications that may affect the area.
Treaty	Treaty of Waitangi (see Appendix A).

ABBREVIATIONS

AJHR	Appendix to the Journals of the House of Representatives.
AJLC	Appendix to the Journals of the Legislative Council.
DoC	Department of Conservation.
LGA	Local Government Act (2002).
MfE	Ministry for the Environment.
NPDC	New Plymouth District Council.
NZIER	The New Zealand Institute of Economic Research Inc.
NZPD	New Zealand Parliamentary Debates (Hansard).
PKW	Parininihi Ki Waitotara Incorporation.
RMA	Resource Management Act (1991).
STDC	South Taranaki Regional Council.
SWPoA	Sustainable Water Programme of Action.
TAIA	Te Atiawa Iwi Authority (representative organisation for Te Atiawa Iwi).
TCC	Taranaki Catchment Commission.
TKoR	Te Kāhui o Rauru (representative organisation for Ngā Rauru Kiitahi Iwi).
TMTB	Taranaki Maori Trust Board.
TPK	Te Puni Kōkiri – Ministry of Māori Development (est. 1991).
TRC	Taranaki Regional Council.
TRoNM	Te Runanga o Ngāti Mutunga (representative organisation for Ngāti Mutunga Iwi).

UNITS OF MEASUREMENT

In this thesis, land area is generally stated in hectares, although some sources also use acres. Conversion rates are as follows:

1 acre	= 4046.85 metres squared.
	= 4840 yards squared.
1 hectare	= 10, 000 metres squared.
	= 11, 959.90 yards squared.
	= 2.471 acres.

A NOTE ABOUT REFERENCING

Quotations from interviews are referenced with the interviewees' name or job title and the date. Archival sources are referenced in footnotes; the record number and document name (if appropriate) are provided, and the full reference is listed in the reference list. Any images that are not referenced are my own. Supplementary material is provided in Appendices. Because each appendix contains several different items, in-text references refer to the Appendix (A-G) firstly, and then to the specific item number within the Appendix.