A New Approach to the Social Capital and the Social Networks of Australian Families

Sheila D. Watkins BSocSc (Hons) (Macquarie University)

This Thesis is Presented in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Sociology

Faculty of Arts

Macquarie University Sydney

September 2009

Table of Conta	nta		ii
5			
•			V
			vii
-			ix
•			<i>x</i>
			xii
0	ents		xiii
Chapter 1:		Introduction	1
	1.1	Perspectives on Families	2
	1.2	Thesis Structure	18
Part I		Theoretical and Analytic Instruments to Examine	
		Family Social Networks and a Literature Review of	
		Network Characteristics	22
Chapter 2:		Social Capital – The Value of Connections	23
	2.1	Defining Social Capital	24
		The Evolution of the Social Capital Debate	24
		The Emergence of the Term	25
		Social Capital as a Concept	27
		Social Capital as an Agenda	33
		The Agenda Spreads	40
		The Social Capital Explosion	44
Chapter 3:		Social Capital as Resources	48
<u>-</u>	3.1	Shortfalls of Social Capital Theories	49
	011	Problems in Conceptualising and Measuring Social	.,
		Capital	49
		Problems with Ownership	51
		Comparability of Observations	53
		The Dark Side of Social Capital	53 54
	3.2	Lin's Theory of Social Capital	55
	5.2	Conceptualizing Social Capital	59
Chapter 4:		Networks and Social Capital	64
Chapter 4.	4.1	±	65
	4.1	Network Typologies Formal vs. Informal Groupings of Interactions	
			65 72
		Types of Ties	
		Distinctions within Networks	77 70
	1.0	Criteria for Placing Networks into Typologies	79
	4.2	Social Network Analysis	80
		Development of Social Network Analysis	81
	4.0	Criticisms of Social Network Analysis	92
~ -	4.3	Conclusions from Chapter Four	94
Chapter 5:		Characteristics of Networks	95
	5.1	Types of Network Participation	95
		Social Participation in Networks	97
		Community Participation in Networks	99
		Civic Participation in Networks	103
		Economic Participation in Networks	104
	5.2	Embedded Network Location	109

Table of Contents

	5.3	Independence as a Norm	113
		Norm of Reciprocity and the Link to Independence	117
		Conflicts in Networks	121
	5.4	Conclusions from Chapter Five	122
Part II		Research Procedures	124
Chapter 6:		Research Procedures	125
r	6.1	Research Strategy	126
	011	Methodological Considerations	126
		The Strategy	128
	6.2	Data Collection and Analysis	132
	0.2	Considerations in Data Collection	133
		Interview Instrument	137
		Pilot Study	145
		The Sample	145
		Data Display	149
		Data Reduction	154
		Drawing Conclusions	157
	6.3	Network Characteristics	158
	0.5	Network Participation	150
		Embedded Locations of Networks	160
		The Norm of Independence	161
	6.4	Community Profiles	163
	0.4	Local Newspapers, Brochures and Websites	165
		Checklist of Neighbourhood Facilities	169
	6.5	Ethical Considerations	170
	0.5 6.6		170
Part III	0.0	Limitations of the Study	171
		Typologies and Social Capital in this Study	
Chapter 7:	71	Network Typologies in This Study	174
	7.1	Development of Network Typologies	175
	7.2	The Typologies in this Study	182
		The Heterogeneous Typology - Dancing to Many Tunes.	184
		The Homogeneous Typology - Peas in a Pod	191
		The Balanced Typology - Six of One, Half a Dozen of	107
		the Other	197
		The Insular Typology - A Little Bit of Love	201
		The Truncated Typology - A Fractured Affair	205
	7.3	Summary of Typologies in this Study	207
Chapter 8:	0.1	Levels of Social Capital	210
	8.1	Social Capital in this Study	211
		Mobilized Social Capital	211
		Accessible Social Capital	218
	8.2	Levels of Social Capital in the Typologies	222
	8.3	Summary of Analysis	237
	8.4	Levels of Social Capital: Findings	239
Part IV		Factors that Constrain or Enhance Access to Social	
		Capital	241
Chapter 9:		Participation and Social Capital	243
	9.1	Network Participation in this Study	244
		Participation in the Heterogeneous Typology	244
		Participation in the Homogeneous Typology	250

		Partici	bation in the Balanced Typology	255
		Partici	bation in the Insular Typology	259
			pation in the Truncated Typology	263
	9.2		ss about Network Participation	266
Chapter 10:		-	on and Opportunity	268
1	10.1		s in this Study	272
			uurra/St. Ives Area of Sydney	273
			ninsula Area of Sydney	287
			lls Area of Sydney	301
			by Shire Area of Sydney	313
	10.2		ce of Place on Social Networks and Social	
				320
	10.3		Based Connections and Social Capital by	
			gies	324
Chapter 11:			ndence and Social Capital	330
1	11.1	-	ndence as a Norm for Particular Families	333
	11.2	-	orms of Independence in Relations to the Norm of	
			ocity, and Conflicts in Networks	335
		-	ndence, Reciprocity, Conflicts and Social Capital	
		-	Heterogeneous Typology	336
			ndence, Reciprocity, Conflicts and Social Capital	
		in the H	Homogeneous and Balanced Typologies	341
		Indepe	ndence, Reciprocity, Conflicts and Social Capital	
		in the I	nsular and Truncated Typologies	348
	11.3	Summa	ary of Independence and Social Capital	353
	11.4	Conclu	ding Remarks on Independence	355
Chapter 12:		Conclu	sion: Family as an Active and Engaged Social	
		Entity.		357
Bibliography		•••••		365
Appendices:	Appendix 1		Advertisement for Participants for Research	
			Study	392
	Appe	ndix 2	Placements of Advertisements by Suburbs in	
			Sydney	394
	Appe	ndix 3	Summary of Codes Used in this Research	395
	Appe	ndix 4	Legend for Sociograms	398
	Appe	ndix 5	Scales for Coding	399
	Appe	ndix 6	Publications Consulted to Develop Community	
			Profiles	411
	Appe	ndix 7	Websites Consulted in Development of	
			Community Profiles	413
	Appe	ndix 8	Final Codes Used in Newspaper and Website	
			Study	414
	Appe	ndix 9	Sample Letter of Consent	415
	Appe	ndix 10	Network Occupations and Prestige Ratings	
			Used in this Study	418
Glossary of Al	obrevia	tions, Te	chnical Terms and Policies Used in this Thesis	420

Index of Tables

Table 1.1	Percentages of Cohabitating Couples in Australia	3
Table 1.2	Marital Status of Australian Population 15 Years+ by	
	Percentage, 1954-2001	5
Table 1.3	One-Parent Families (with dependent children) in Australia as	
	Percentage of Family Types, 1976-2001	6
Table 4.1	Summary of Typologies used in Other Research	78
Table 6.1	Interview Instrument Section 1 - Demographics Details and Attitudes	138
Table 6.2	Interview Instrument Section 2 - Name Generator	140
Table 6.3	Interview Instrument Section 3 - Resource Generator	142
Table 6.4	Interview Instrument Section 4 - Position Generator	144
Table 6.5	Family Members Represented in this Study, their Occupations	1.1
1000 0.5	and Ages	148
Table 6.6	Checklist of Neighbourhood Facilities	169
Table 7.1	Criteria for Heterogeneous, Homogeneous and Balanced	107
10010 7.1	Typologies	177
Table 7.2	Summary of Three Criteria for Placing Each Network into a	1//
1 able 7.2	Typology	183
Table 7.3	Comparison of Heterogeneity in the Heterogeneous Typology	185
Table 7.3 Table 7.4	Comparison of Heterogeneity in the Homogeneous Typology.	189
Table 7.4 Table 7.5	Comparison of Heterogeneity in the Balanced Typology	190
Table 7.6	Comparison of Diversity in the Insular Typology	204
Table 8.1	Mobilized Resources Based on Claims by Participants of Ties	216
T 11 0 0	through which Support was Received	216
Table 8.2	Number of Ties from which Support was Expected by	220
T 11 0 2	Participants	220
Table 8.3	Occupational Access in this Study	221
Table 8.4	Total Mobilized Social Capital in the Duncan Network	231
Table 8.5	Total Social Capital in the Duncan Network (from Tables 8.1,	
	8.2 and 8.3)	232
Table 8.6	Average Social Capital in each Typology	233
Table 10.1	Facilities and Services within Five Kilometres of Each	
	Participant's House in the Turramurra/St. Ives Area (Preset	
	List of 29)	275
Table 10.2	Advertised Community Associations and Events within Five	
	Kilometres of Each Participant's House in the Turramurra/St.	
	Ives Area	276
Table 10.3	Comparison of BOSCAR 2004 Statistics which Cover the	
	Turramurra/St. Ives Area to Statistics for Sydney	277
Table 10.4	Facilities and Services within Five Kilometres of Each	
	Participant's House in the Peninsula Area (Preset List of	
	29)	289
Table 10.5	Advertised Community Associations and Events within Five	
	Kilometres of Each Participant's House in the Peninsula Area.	291
Table 10.6	Comparison of BOSCAR 2004 Statistics for the Peninsula	
	Area to Statistics for Sydney	292

Table 10.7	Facilities and Services within Five Kilometres of Each	
	Participant's House in the Hills Area (Preset List of 29)	302
Table 10.8	Advertised Community Associations and Events within Five	
	Kilometres of Each Participant's House in the Hills Area	304
Table 10.9	Comparison of BOSCAR 2004 Statistics for the Hills Area to	
	Statistics for Sydney	306
Table 10.10	Facilities and Services within Five Kilometres of Each	
	Participant's House in the Hornsby Area (Preset List of 29)	315
Table 10.11	Advertised Community Associations and Events within Five	
	Kilometres of Each Participant's House in the Hornsby Area	316
Table 10.12	Comparison Of BOSCAR 2004 Statistics which Cover the	
	Hills Area to Statistics for Sydney	317
Table 10.13	Summary of Place-Based Connections and their Social	
	Capital	324
Table 11.1	Total Support Reported as Provided to Network Members	346

Index of Figures

Figure 1.1	Proportion of Marriages Preceded by Cohabitation by Year of Marriage, Australia, pre 1960-2001	
Eigura 1.2		
Figure 1.2	Population Growth by Age in Australia 2002-2007	4
Figure 3.1	Theoretical Propositions of Lin's Social Capital Theory	
Figure 6.1	Model of this Study	13
Figure 6.2	Components of the Miles and Huberman Approach to	11
Elemente (2	Analysis	13
Figure 6.3	Diagram of Resources from this Study using Foa and Foa's	14
Element C 4	(1974) Scale	15
Figure 6.4	Sociogram of the Hunter Network from this Study	1.
Figure 6.5	Correlation Formula Used by Excel Correl	1.
Figure 7.1	Summaries of Network Typologies in this Study	18
Figure 7.2	The Heterogeneous Typology in this Study	18
Figure 7.3	Sociogram of the Heterogeneous Archer Network Showing	
	Formal and Informal Groupings	18
Figure 7.4	Sociogram of the Heterogeneous Grace Network Showing	
	Formal and Informal Groupings	18
Figure 7.5	The Homogeneous Typology in this Study	1
Figure 7.6	Sociogram of the Homogeneous Oates Network Showing	
	Formal and Informal Groupings	1
Figure 7.7	Sociogram of the Homogeneous Queen Network Showing	
	Formal and Informal Groupings	1
Figure 7.8	The Balanced Typology in this Study	1
Figure 7.9	Sociogram of the Balanced Hunter Network Showing	
	Formal and Informal Groupings	19
Figure 7.10	The Insular Typology in this Study	20
Figure 7.11	Sociogram of the Insular Farmer Network Showing Formal	
C	and Informal Groupings	20
Figure 7.12	The Truncated Typology in this Study	20
Figure 8.1a	Financial Support from the Duncan Network	22
Figure 8.1b	Inspiration from the Duncan Network	2
Figure 8.1c	Encouragement from the Duncan Network	2
Figure 8.1d	Emotional Support from the Duncan Network	2
Figure 8.1e	Practical Support from the Duncan Network	2
Figure 8.1f	Companionship from the Duncan Network	2
Figure 9.1	Sociogram of the Heterogeneous Archer Network Showing	
I Iguie 9.1	Types of Participation after Final Analysis	24
Figure 9.2	Sociogram of the Homogeneous Oates Network Showing	2-
riguic <i>J.2</i>	Types of Participation after Final Analysis	25
Figure 0.3	•••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••	Ζ.
Figure 9.3	Soiogram of the Balanced Logan Network Showing Types	24
Elemento 4	of Participation after Final Analysis	2.
Figure 9.4	Sociogram of the Insular Erikson Network Showing Types	~
D ' A F	of Participation after Final Analysis	20
Figure 9.5	Sociogram of the Truncated Ireland Network Showing	-
	Types of Participation after Final Analysis	20
Figure 10.1	Networks within Each Locale in this Study	27

Figure 10.2	Sociogram of the Heterogeneous Grace Network Displaying	
	Local and Non-local Connections	279
Figure 10.3	Sociogram of the Truncated Player Network Displaying	
	Local and Non-local Connections	281
Figure 10.4	Sociogram of the Homogeneous Oates Network Displaying	
	Local and Non-local Connections	294
Figure 10.5	Sociogram of the Balanced Norris Network Displaying	
	Local and Non-local Connections	296
Figure 10.6	Sociogram of the Heterogeneous Duncan Network	
	Displaying Local and Non-local Connections	308
Figure 10.7	Sociogram of the Insular Erikson Network Displaying Local	
	and Non-local Connections	310
Figure 10.8	Sociogram of the Truncated Ireland Network Displaying	
	Local and Non-local Connections	318
Figure 11.1	Proposed Relationship between Norms of Independence,	
	Reciprocity and Social Capital	331
Figure 11.2	Suggested Continuum to Show a Link between Attitudes	
	towards Independence and Levels of Social Capital	334
Figure 11.3	Comparison of Norms of Independence to Levels of Social	
	Capital, Based on Attitudes to Using Social Connections,	
	Norms of Reciprocity and Conflicts,	353

Index of Plates

Plate 10.1	Mansion Style Home	273
Plate 10.2	St. Ives Shopping Village	273
Plate 10.3	St. Ives Mountain Bike Club	273
Plate 10.4	North Turramurra Shops	273
Plate 10.5	St. Ives Jewish Community	273
Plate 10.6	North Turramurra	273
Plate 10.7	Single Story Brick Home	273
Plate 10.8	Older Style Home	287
Plate 10.9	Manly Beach	287
Plate 10.10	Sailing off Narrabeen	287
Plate 10.11	Manly Corso	287
Plate 10.12	New Units and Apartments	287
Plate 10.13	New Double Story Residence	287
Plate 10.14	Netball at Curl Curl	287
Plate 10.15	Paul the Strawberry Man	300
Plate 10.16	Tree Planting at Fagan Park	300
Plate 10.17	Newer Double Story Home on Large Block	300
Plate 10.18	Galston Valley Railway	300
Plate 10.19	Galston Country Music Festival Awards	300
Plate 10.20	Newer Single Story Home on Large Block	300
Plate 10.21	Fibro Home on Large Block	300
Plate 10.22	Hornsby Train Station	313
Plate 10.23	Hornsby Girls High School	313
Plate 10.24	Hornsby Country Fair	313
Plate 10.25	Single Level Brick Home	313
Plate 10.26	Older Fibro Home	313
Plate 10.27	Park in Hornsby	313
Plate 10.28	Pacific Highway, Hornsby	313

Summary

The existence of families has long been seen as fundamental to the structure and health of a society. Nevertheless, current sociological thought sees family in terms of a 'haven', as a private, isolated unit, a place in which individual members can retreat from society. The reality of 'family' in today's Australian society does not fit this model, if it ever did. This thesis aims to provide a new approach to the family, one that sees family as active and engaged. It also argues that, as a result of its connected nature, this family is able to provide a type of value to its members. This value is conceived of as social capital. The ability of this family to generate social capital through its networks makes the family an interactive social entity, underpinning its position as part of the structure of society.

However, some social networks are more able to supply benefits than others. By exploring types of participation in terms of social, community, civic and economic participation, as well as formal and informal engagement, the thesis argues that while active participation is essential in generating benefits there are factors which can impinge on such participation. The effects of 'place' or the embedded locations of networks is undoubtedly important in bonding people within communities and acting as a bridge to others, however, the thesis finds that communities of interest generate more social capital. The thesis also argues that attitudes toward family independence or autonomy may compromise network exchange. Variations in the meaning of the norm of independence either emphasize the interdependency of society or highlight a definitive responsibility of the individual and family. In the former, the interdependency of society is emphasized. In the latter, network exchange is

Х

compromised. Independence thus becomes an essential element in the measurement of social capital and a cultural dimension of why some social networks are better able to supply benefits.

Declaration

I certify that the work in this thesis entitled *A New Approach to the Social Capital and the Social Networks of Australian Families* has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree to any other university or institution other than Macquarie University.

I also certify that the thesis is an original piece of research and it has been written by me. Any help and assistance that I have received in my research work and the preparation of this thesis itself have been appropriately acknowledged.

In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

The research presented in this thesis was approved by Macquarie University Ethics Review Committee, reference number: HE24OCT2003-D02637.

Sheila D. Watkins Student Number 79223796 Date: September 8, 2009

Acknowledgments

I owe a debt of gratitude to many people who have assisted me in completing this thesis.

First, I must thank my supervisor, Associate Professor Michael Fine. Michael provided inspiration and encouragement, as well as difficult and confounding critiques, making me stretch the boundaries of what I though possible. His courteous support has enabled me to complete this difficult task. I would also like to show my appreciation to the Sociology Department of Macquarie University. Every member of the staff has been tremendously supportive. Special thanks go to Associate Professor Pauline Johnson and Dr. Harry Blatterer.

I am especially indebted to two friends for their guidance and willingness to help at all times: Sandey Fitzsgerald and Verity Greenwood. Both have provided unending emotional support and were always willing to discuss my ideas. Sandey has also acted as editor for this thesis and has earned my eternal gratitude.

I owe the greatest debt to my family. While my mother Edythe and my sister Peggy have always inspired and encouraged me, my darling daughter Kylie has picked up the reins of our extended family while I've completed this journey. Peggy has also been an editor to my work. My son Ian and son-in-law Jon have provided recommendations that have greatly improved the content, while my daughter-in-law Jennifer has ensured our home life has continued. Finally, my dearest husband Alan has unswervingly

xiii

provided his love, motivation, encouragement and emotional support, as well as technical guidance. Without the help of my family, I would never have finished this thesis.

I would also like to acknowledge the many people who have provided photos to use in this document: Narelle Cope, John Graham, Linda Taylor and Alan Watkins. Their photos have brought the locations used in this study alive.