THE ELECTRIFICATION OF THE SYDNEY ENERGY SYSTEM 1881 - 1986

George Wilkenfeld

B Arch (Hons) A A Dipl Grad (Hons) M Phil

Thesis for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Centre for Environmental and Urban Studies Macquarie University

> Sydney February 1989

SYNOPSIS

All technological systems require energy. The concentration of human population and economic activity in cities has relied on the development of urban energy systems, which bring energy to the city and distribute it to points of end use within it. Over the past century, electro-technology has come to dominate urban energy systems throughout the developed world. This process has been imperfectly documented and analysed, because the relationships between electricity and the energy service markets and local political frameworks within which each instance of urban electrification has taken place have generally been neglected.

This thesis presents electrification as an historical change in the urban energy system. It identifies the most important influences on urban energy demand and on the organisation of energy supply, and traces their interaction before the introduction of electro-technology, then from the beginning of electrification in the 1880s to its completion in the 1980s.

Urban electrification is best observed and understood by following its course within a single city. Sydney is well suited to such an analysis, since it is highly electrified and encompasses within its two hundred year history all the major energy technologies of the past millenium. During the first century of its existence, it developed distinctively urban markets for transportation, street lighting, commercial, industrial and residential energy services. These were revolutionised by steam and by gas, the first specifically urban energy technology.

The thesis examines how each energy form in turn gained a foothold in the Sydney energy system, diffused through it and spread beyond it to the rest of the state of New South Wales. It analyses long term trends in each of the various urban energy markets, and draws parallels in the pattern of succession of supply technologies. It demonstrates that these patterns were repeated with the introduction of electricity and, in the 1970s, by its emerging successors.

During Sydney's second century each of its energy markets was electrified in turn, while its separate electricity supply systems coalesced into a unified grid serving the entire metropolis, and extending later into the rest of the state. Largely as a result of political circumstances in the 1880s, when electric lighting was first introduced, the municipal electricity supply organisations acquired considerable influence and autonomy, and resisted the later attempts of state governments to co-ordinate their development.

The electrification of the Sydney and NSW energy systems had largely run its course by the late 1970s. Electricity supply had exhausted the economies of scale and technological development which had given it an advantage over other fuels. It had saturated the urban energy markets, and was facing new competitors in the form of natural gas and more efficient utilisation technologies. These changes in the energy system exacerbated the inherent problems in the organisation of electricity supply, which was predicated on unlimited growth and slow to adapt to the end of electrification.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people and organisations have been involved in one way or another over the six and a half years that I have been working on this thesis, and there are many to thank. The thesis could not have been completed without concentrated periods of full time work. In this I was fortunate to have the support of my employer for the last seven years, the Department of Energy (formerly the Energy Authority of New South Wales). Under the leadership of the General Manager of the Authority, John Dembecki, and then the Director of the Department, John Webb, the organisation provided me with the necessary time and financial assistance. I must also thank my managers, especially Graeme Couch, who not only took my occasional long absences with good grace but actively encouraged me to get the project finished.

Additional financial support was provided by the Faculty of Architecture at the University of Adelaide, in the form of a Clive Boyce Fellowship which enabled me to buy a personal computer, and by a Commonwealth Postgraduate Research Award. The Centre for Environmental and Urban Studies at Macquarie University, under its Director Alistair Gilmour, was of course my academic home base and also provided me with valuable logistic support.

I spoke to many people and worked in many libraries during the course of research. Bob Irving and Emery Balint at the University of New South Wales and Roger Sharp at the Museum of Applied Arts and Sciences were particularly helpful. I am also grateful for the unfailing assistance of the librarians at the incomparable Mitchell Library, the Energy Authority library and the Sydney City Council archives.

I received helpful comments on individual chapter drafts from John Dembecki, John Webb, Graeme Couch and John Brain. Many of my colleagues at the Department also contributed (unwittingly, I should hasten to add) to the development of my main themes. It should come as no surprise that these are generally consistent with the aims, approaches and corporate culture which evolved between the establishment of the Energy Authority by the Wran government in 1976 and the abolition of the Department of Energy by the Greiner government in October 1988. If all human endeavour is marked by two steps forward and one step back, then the Department represented two firm steps forward for the NSW energy system.

My two academic supervisors at Macquarie University helped me focus my interest in the energy system on the key technology of electricity, and guided me into the broader contexts of Australian urban, political, and economic history. Bob Fagan, of the School of Earth Sciences, was always helpful in precisely the right ways at the right times. I am grateful also to my main supervisor, Peter Spearitt of the School of History, Philosophy and Politics, for his expertise, the light and sure touch of his supervision, his patience, his unfailing good humour and much else besides.

My greatest debt is to my wife Sandy, who gave her time unstintingly to help me with research, commented on my drafts, listened and reacted to my ideas, and above all put up with all this for what often seemed like an interminable period.

This thesis is my own work, and has not been submitted for a higher degree at any other university or institution.

George Wilkenf

February 1989

\sim						•	
S	W	n	Λ	n	c	1	c
J	7		v	ν	3	1	3

Acknowledgement	A	ckn	owl	edg	em	en	ts
-----------------	---	-----	-----	-----	----	----	----

Table of Contents

Table of Illustrations

Abbreviations, Units and Dates	
1. ELECTRIFICATION: AN HISTORICAL PROCESS	1
ELECTRICITY AND THE SYDNEY ENERGY SYSTEM IN 1986 Energy Flows Across the Urban Boundary Fuel Consumption in the Sydney Techno-Energy System Indicators of Electrification	
MODELS OF ELECTRIFICATION General Models of Electrification The Dimension of Space The Dimension of Time The Economic Model	18
THE MISSING ELEMENTS A Typology of End Use Constant factors in Long Term Change Ministers and Managers: The Political Dimension	30
THE SYNTHESIS OF ELEMENTS History and Growth Energy, Technology and Urbanisation Politics and the Benefits of Electrification	45
2. A PREHISTORY OF ELECTRIFICATION: THE SYDNEY ENERGY SYSTEM TO 1881	51
RENEWABLE ENERGY AND THE DISCOVERY OF COAL The Aboriginal Energy System The Energy Technology of the Settlers Local Energy Resources The Role of the Government Sydney and its Energy System in 1841	
MECHANISATION AND ENERGISATION The Impact of Technology Energy Demand and Urban Services: More of Everything The Energy Market Sydney and its Energy System in 1881	69

3. SLOW DAWN OF THE ELECTRIC LIGHT, 1881 - 1904	91
THE INTRODUCTION OF ELECTRICITY Developments in Electro-Technology Electricity Comes to Sydney	
THE MUNICIPALISATION OF STREET LIGHTING Municipal Powers and Public Lighting The First Electric Street Lighting The First Skirmish with Gas	98
GOVERNMENT AND POWER: THE SYDNEY ELECTRICITY FRANCHISE Parliament and the Labor Party Government and Utilities The Competition to Supply Sydney Victory by Attrition: The Sydney Municipal Council	107
THE SYDNEY ENERGY SYSTEM AT THE TURN OF THE CENTURY From Horses to Electric Traction Energy Demand in the Factory and the Home The Emerging Energy Grids	121
4. THE MOMENTUM OF GROWTH, 1904 - 1932	133
THE ELECTRICITY UNDERTAKING OUTGROWS THE COUNCIL The Development of Policy The Expansion of Supply The Growth of Demand Strategic Expansion to the Suburbs	
A FRAMEWORK FOR ELECTRIFICATION The Emergence of the County Council A Niche for Private Capital: the Electric Light and Power Supply Corporation Electricity and the Public Interest: Safety, Rationing, Pricing and Access Foundations of an Electrical Industry	147
THE SYDNEY ENERGY SYSTEM IN THE 1930s The Heyday of Electric Transport The Transformation of Industry The Residential Sector: Plugged In But Not Switched On The Reticulated Energy System	158
5. THE STATE TAKES CHARGE, 1932 - 1950	171
THE CENTRALISATION OF POWER The Development of Electricity Policy The Problem of Co-ordination	
THE SYDNEY COUNTY COUNCIL: NEW NAME, OLD HABITS Formation of the County Council Pricing and Promotion: Maintaining Momentum The Post War Crisis	184
THE SYDNEY ENERGY SYSTEM AFTER THE WAR The Demand for Electrical Energy Services The Sydney Grid Becomes the State Grid The Gas System: Losing Momentum	193

6. TRIUMPH OF THE GRID, 1950 - 1986	209
ELECTRICITY AND THE STATE Electricity Policy: The Distribution of Costs and Benefits Legislation and Administration Management by Amalgamation	
SYDNEY'S LEGACY The Sydney County Council and its Policies The Consequences of Price Distortion	226
THE SYDNEY AND NSW ENERGY SYSTEM, 1950 - 1986 The New Generation The Residential Sector: Electrified At Last Industrial Energy Demand: The Long Boom Ends Natural Gas: The Coming Fuel	235
7. THE LIMITS TO ELECTRIFICATION	261
ELECTRIFICATION AND URBAN ENERGY DEMAND Historical Growth Limitations	
URBAN ENERGY SERVICES: A DECEPTIVE UNITY The Dynamics of Demand Forecasting and Managing	269
POLITICS AND THE ELECTRICITY SYSTEM The Imprint of History Beyond Electrification	275
Chapter Notes	281
Appendix: A Note on Sources	355
Bibliography	360

MAPS, DIAGRAMS AND TABLES

MAPS AND DIAGRAMS

- Fig 1.1 Primary Energy Collection by the Sydney Energy System, 1986
- Fig 1.2 Boundaries of the Sydney Statistical Division and Reticulated Energy Supply Organisations, 1986
- Fig 2.1 Schematic Diagram of the Sydney Energy System, 1841
- Fig 2.2 Location of Main Power Sources and Extent of Gas Reticulation, Sydney, 1841
- Fig 2.3 Trends in Coal and Gas Prices and Average Wage Rates, NSW, 1860-1900
- Fig 3.1 Elements in early systems for the production and distribution of electric lighting
- Fig 3.2 The progress of energy-related bills in the NSW parliament, 1881-1904
- Fig 4.1 Sydney Local Government Areas with electricity supply, 1905-1935
- Fig 4.2 Total electricity generating capacity, SMC, 1904-1935
- Fig 4.3 Domestic energy tariffs, SMC and AGL, 1904-35
- Fig 4.4 Average energy sales per consumer, SMC, AGL and SGCC, 1904-1935
- Fig 5.1 Average prices by consumer classes, SCC, 1933-1951
- Fig 5.2 Interconnected electricity system energy flows, 1946
- Fig 5.3 Per capita electricity and gas consumption, Sydney, rest of NSW and other states, 1933-1952
- Fig 6.1 Electricity distribution authorities, NSW, 1947-86
- Fig 6.2 Electricity distribution authorities by local government areas, Sydney, 1949-80
- Fig 6.3 Average electricity prices by consumer class, SCC, 1950-86
- Fig 6.4 Average electricity prices by consumer class, Sydney and rest of NSW, 1965-85
- Fig 6.5 Actual and proposed power station sites, NSW 1985
- Fig 6.6 Size of larget thermal generating plant, NSW, 1899-1980
- Fig 6.7 Percentage of households connected to gas and electricity, Sydney and rest of NSW, 1947-86
- Fig 6.8 Average gas and electricity consumption per household and per capita, Sydney and NSW, 1950-86
- Fig 6.9 Penetration rates, electric-only appliances, NSW 1947-86
- Fig 6.10 Penetration rates, substitutable appliances, Sydney and NSW, 1947-86
- Fig 6.11 Three year moving average of rates of increase in electricity consumption PCC and SCC, 1950-86
- Fig 7.1 Sectoral Shares of Electrical energy demand, Sydney and Rest of NSW, 1906-86

TABLES

- Tab 1.1 Delivered Energy Use by Consumption Sector, Sydney, 1986
- Tab 1.2 Primary Energy Sources, Sydney, 1971 and 1986
- Tab 1.3 Energy Consumption by Fuel and End Use, Per Capita and per Area, Sydney and Rest of NSW, 1971 and 1986
- Tab 1.4 Energy Consumption by Primary Fuel, States, 1982/3
- Tab 1.5 Electricity Consumption per Capita and Electricity Price Indices, States, 1985/6
- Tab 1.6 Main Features of Household reticulated Energy Consumption by Capital City, Australia, 1986
- Tab 1.7 Capital Investment in Public Electricity Supply and Railways, NSW. 1985/6
- Tab 1.8 Time Scale of Change in The Techno-Energy System
- Tab 1.9 Household Expenditure on Bio- and Techno-energy Services, Sydney, 1974/5 and 1984
- Tab 1.10 Classification of End Use
- Tab 1.11 Industrial Sector End Use, NSW, 1984/5
- Tab 1.12 End Use Analysis of Residential Energy Demand, NSW, 1986
- Tab 1.13 Residential Energy Services and Fuels, NSW 1986 and Victoria 1982
- Tab 1.14 Organisation of Electricity Supply by States, Australia, 1986
- Tab 2.1 Estimated Output of Early Grain Mills, Sydney and Parramatta, 1788-1822
- Tab 2.2 Coal Production, Exports and Domestic Consumption, NSW, 1822-81
- Tab 2.3 Ratio of Bond to Free Labour, NSW and Sydney, 1822-51
- Tab 2.4 Population and Workforce at the census, NSW and Sydney 1841
- Tab 2.5 Number of public and private gas lamps, Sydney 1843-81
- Tab 2.6 Motive power in mills and factories, NSW and Sydney, 1841-81
- Tab 2.6 Gas Lamps and Sales, 1841-81
- Tab 2.7 Gas sales, customers numbers and per capita consumption, AGL 1841-81
- Tab 3.1 Gas works, NSW, 1837-1904
- Tab 3.2 Municipal electric lighting installations, NSW, 1888-1902
- Tab 3.3 Sydney Electric Lighting Bills, 1888-1896
- Tab 3.4 Passenger journeys by railway and tramway by energy type, Sydney and NSW, 1889-1904
- Tab 3.5 Power of machinery installed in factories and in heat. light, fuel and power works, Sydney and NSW, 1886-1902

- Tab 3.6 Domestic Servants, NSW 1841-1901
- Tab 3.7 Heat, Light, Fuel and Power Works, Sydney and NSW 1886- 1902
- Tab 3.8 AGL and NSW gas production and sales, 1881-1904
- Tab 4.1 Electricity undertakings acquired by the SMC, 1907-1913
- Tab 4.2 Contribution of acquired business to energy sales, SMC, 1907-1910
- Tab 4.3 Average prices, operating profits and return on capital, SMC, 1910-1935
- Tab 4.4 Approximate net return on capital invested by supply areas, SMC, 1913-1921
- Tab 4.5 Comparative statistics, SMC and ELPSC, 1926
- Tab 4.6 Main electricity systems, NSW 1936
- Tab 4.7 Public transport trips by energy type, Sydney, 1935/36
- Tab 4.8 Power of machinery in central energy systems and manufacturing, NSW, 1901-1936
- Tab 4.9 Value of fuel used by selected industries, NSW, 1935/36
- Tab 4.10 Estimated consumption of electricity by consumer class, Sydney, 1936
- Tab 4.11 Estimated per capita production of gas and electricity, Sydney, rest of NSW and Australia, 1933
- Tab 5.1 Major Inquiries into Electricity Co-ordination, NSW, 1920-44
- Tab 5.2 Current and adjusted average prices by consumer classes SCC, 1939-1949
- Tab 5.3 Electricity consumption by consumer class, SCC, 1933-1951
- Tab 5.4 Estimated electricity consumption by consumer class, Sydney, 1946
- Tab 5.5 Power of machinery used in central electricity systems and in manufacturing, NSW, 1936-1950
- Tab 5.6 Household energy facilities at the 1947 census, Sydney, NSW and Australia
- Tab 5.7 Estimated public transport trips by mode and energy type, Sydney, 1946
- Tab 5.8 Estimated gas and electricity energy production, Sydney, NSW and Australia, 1946
- Tab 5.9 Power stations and electricity generation, NSW and Australia, 1936-1950
- Tab 6.1 Penetration rates of major domestic appliances, Sydney and rest of NSW, 1980-86
- Tab 6.2 Energy demand by consumer classes, NSW, 1978-86
- Tab 6.3 Percentage of dwellings connected to electricity, Sydney and rest of NSW, 1947-71
- Tab 6.4 Estimated electricity consumption by consumer class, Sydney, 1956
- Tab 6.5 Sales of electrically by consumer class and per capita, Sydney and rest of NSW, 1936-86
- Tab 6.6 Percentage of households connected to gas, Sydney and rest of NSW, 1947-86
- Tab 6.7 Gas consumption by consumer class and per capita, Sydney and rest of NSW, 1936-86

ABBREVIATIONS, UNITS AND DATES

ABBREVIATIONS

(An additional list of abbreviations used only in references and in the Bibliography precedes the Bibliography)

AAC

Australian Agricultural Company

ABS

Australian Bureau of Statistics

AC

Alternating current

ACT

Australian Capital Territory

AET

Australasian Electrical Times

AGL

Australian Gas Light Company

AGL/DM

AGL Directors' Minutes

AGLS

AGL Sydney

ALP

Australian Labor Party

ASIC

Australian Standard Industrial Classification

AYB

Yearbook of Australia

BRE

Bureau of Resource Economics

BST

Bulk suply tariff

BWCC

Brisbane Water County Council

CGE

Commissioner for Gas and Electricity

CWG

Carburetted water gas

DC

Direct current

DT

Daily Telegraph

EAC

Electricity Advisory Committee

EANSW

Electricity Authority of NSW

ECELB

Electrical Contractors' and Electricians' Licensing Board

ECNSW

Electricity Commission of NSW

EFS

Engineering and Financial Statistics (of electricity supply authorities in NSW)

ELPSC

Electric Light and Power Supply Corporation (Balmain)

EnANSW

Energy Authority of NSW

ESAA

Electricity Supply Association of Australia

ETSA

Electricity Trust of South Australia

ETU

Electrical Trades Union

GFCV Gas and Fuel Corporation of Victoria

GPO General Post Office

HEC Hydro-Electric Commission of Tasmania

HRA Historic Records of Australia

HV High voltage

JCB Joint Coal Board

LA Legislative Assembly

LC Legislative Council

LCP Liberal - Country Party

LGA Local Government Area

LGEA Local Government Electricity Association

LNP Liberal-National Party

LPG Liquefied petroleum gas

LV Low voltage

MCC Mackellar County Council

m million

MGC Manly Gas Company

MLA Member of the Legislative Assembly

MLC Member of the Legislative Council

NG Natural gas

NSG North Shore Gas Company

NSW New South Wales

NSWPD NSW Parliamentary Debates

NSWPP NSW Parliamentary Papers (ie presented to parliament)

NSWYB Yearbook of NSW

PCC Prospect County Council

PWD Public Works Department

QEC Queensland Electricity Commission

RC Returns of the colony (statistical)

RCCI Royal Commission into the Coal Industry

RD Railways Department

RPT

Rendel, Palmer and Tritton (authors of special report)

SA

South Australia

SAGASCO

South Australian Gas Company

SATS

Sydney Area Travel Survey

SCC

Sydney Council

SECV

State Electricity Commission of Victoria

SECWA

State Energy Commission of Western Australia

SES

Southern Electricity Supply

SG

Sydney Gazette

SGCC

St George County Council

SMC

Sydney Municipal Council

SMC/CC

Sydney City Commissioners

SMC/CS

SMC City Surveyor

SMC/ELC

SMC Electric Lighting Committee

SMC/ELD

SMC Electric Lighting Department

SMC/FC

SMC Finance Committee

SMC/LC

SMC Lighting Committee

SMC/TC

SMC Town Clerk

SMH

Sydney Morning Herald

SMHEA

Snowy Mountains Hydro-Electricity Authority

SRA

State Rail Authority of NSW

SSD

Sydney Statistical Division (as defined by ABS)

TED

Tait's Electrical Directory

TV

Television

VCR

Video cassette recorder

V&P

Votes and Proceedings (of the NSW Parliament)

WA

Western Australia

YE

Year ended

UNITS

BTU

British Thermal Units

C

degree Centigrade

cp candlepower

cu ft cubic feet

d penny

GJ gigajoule (1,000 MJ)

GWh gigawatt-hour (1,000,000 kWh)

hp horsepower

Hz Hertz (cycles per second)

km k ilometre

kV kilovolt (1,000 V)

kW kilowatt

kWh kilowatt-hour (= 3.6 MJ)

L pound (unit of Australian currency prior to 14 February 1966; = 20s or \$2)

lb pound (unit of weight)

MJ megajoule

MW megawatt (1,000 kW)

MWh megawatt-hour (1,000 kWh)

PJ petajoule (1,000,000,000 MJ)

shilling (=12d)

sq km square kilometre

TJ terajoule (1,000,000 MJ)

V volt

W watt

DATES AND YEARS

Abbreviations for names of organisations followed by a year and a page number refer to the annual report of that organisation: eg (SCC 1983,68). Where the abbreviation is followed by a date, the reference is to the minutes of meetings on those dates: eg (SMC 22.1.1889). Where followed by a year and letter, the reference is to a publication of that organisation, listed in the bibliography: eg (EnANSW 1987c,21).

Financial year periods (indicated as, eg, 1976/7 or 1979/80) are defined as the beginning of July to the end of the following June, unless otherwise indicated in the text. Periods of elapsed time are indicated with a dash, eg 1890-95.

The contracted form is sometimes used for 20th century dates: eg 10.7.82 denotes 10 July 1982. For earlier dates the year is given in full: eg 25.3.1865.