

When Travel Matters:
Opportunities, Barriers and Policy Options
for Workplace Travel Management in
Sydney

MICHAEL GREGORY ASKEW

BBus

MES

Thesis submitted for the degree of

PhD (Environmental Studies)

December 2011

Graduate School of the Environment
Department of Environment & Geography
Macquarie University, Sydney NSW

STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. The project has been approved by the Macquarie University Ethics Review Committee (Human Research), protocol number: HE25NOV2005-D04397.

Signed:.....

Date:.....

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

For my darling boy, Andreas. This thesis began before you were born, so all you have ever known is ‘Daddy’s writing his book’. Now Daddy can come and play.

For Hedda. It has been a long, rough road—but we got there. Words cannot possibly explain how your support, your patience and your love have helped me over these many years. Thank you.

I wish to thank Dr Anna Lyth for taking me on as her PhD student. Anna, thank you for maintaining trust in me and in the research project. Your continuous encouragement, constructive feedback and intimate knowledge of the field have been of immeasurable assistance. Thank you to Dr Marco Amati, who courageously accepted the baton of supervisor when Anna left for Tasmania. You have always had faith in the project. Thank you. I am also grateful to Dr Ken Cussen for taking on the role of interim supervisor, and to Helen Battellino for assisting with the development of the survey.

To my little sister, Dr Louise Askew. Thank you for stepping in during the challenging times and steering me back on course. And thank you for all your feedback on the final drafts.

I am grateful for the support provided by the Graduate School of the Environment at Macquarie University—particularly Gunnella Murphy, Associate Professor Trish Fanning and Dr Greg Walkerden. Greg, thank you for sharing your knowledge of complex systems theory and resilience, and for your advice on the thesis logic and structure. Thank you to all those who participated in the research; your reflections and perspectives have enhanced my knowledge of the field. Without your contribution this thesis would not have been possible.

Finally, thank you to my family and friends. Your support and love have got me to the finish line.

Content Acknowledgement: although this thesis is a monograph, parts of section 3.4 (Chapter 3) have been adapted from Askew and Lyth (2007). These parts were developed for the thesis, but are included in the conference paper cited above. I was the first author of the conference paper, to which my contribution was over 80%, and I developed all directly sourced material.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Statement of Originality.....	ii
Acknowledgements.....	iii
Table of Contents.....	iv
List of Illustrations.....	vi
List of Tables.....	vii
Abstract.....	viii
Chapter One – Introduction	1
1.1 Thesis Overview.....	4
1.2 Positioning and Framing the Thesis.....	7
1.3 Thesis Structure.....	10
Chapter Two – WTM: Evolution, Approaches and Potential	14
2.1 Travel Demand Management.....	14
2.2 WTM: Conceptual Clarification, Historical Developments and Planning Practice in Sydney.....	19
2.3 WTM: Motivations, Incentive Mechanisms and Process.....	25
2.4 WTM at the Organisational Level: Development, Implementation and Measures.....	36
2.5 The Effectiveness of WTM Planning Practice.....	43
2.6 The WTM Literature: Overview and Limitations.....	45
Chapter Three – The Dynamic Nature of WTM Policy Settings.....	47
3.1 WTM: A Complex Demand Management Initiative.....	47
3.2 The Spatial, Infrastructural and Economic Dynamics of Cities.....	49
3.3 Issues at the Policy Administrator Level.....	53
3.4 Organisational Dynamics.....	55
3.5 Employee Travel Behaviour.....	65
3.6 From Theory to Practice.....	67
Chapter Four – Methodology.....	69
4.1 Approach to the Field: A Personal Account.....	69
4.2 The Research Field.....	74
4.3 Entering the Field.....	84
4.4 The Research Instruments.....	88
4.5 Data Analysis.....	90
4.6 Presentation of the Findings.....	93
4.7 Research Methods to Results: Linking Approach to Outcomes.....	94
Chapter Five – Participant Perspectives on WTM.....	95
Part A: Awareness, Commitment and Perception.....	97
5.1 Awareness of and Experience with WTM.....	97

5.2	Perceptions of and Commitment to WTM	99
5.3	WTM and Business Practice.....	102
5.4	Motivations for and Benefits of WTM Adoption.....	105
Part B: WTM Measures and Organisational Responsibilities.....		114
5.5	Perceptions of WTM Measures	114
5.6	Organisational Roles and Responsibilities	131
Part C: Barriers To and Opportunities for WTM.....		134
5.7	Barriers to WTM Development, Acceptance and Effectiveness	134
5.8	Organisational Opportunities for WTM	156
Part D: Role of Government, Policy Approaches and Actions.....		161
5.9	Role of Government, Policy Approaches and Actions.....	161
5.10	Results to Analysis: Moving from Descriptive Data to Interpretive Commentary	178
Chapter Six – Towards a Holistic Conception of the WTM Process and System...		179
6.1	Synthesis: Patterns of Consensus and Dissonance	180
6.2	WTM Measures and the ‘Managerial Filter’	189
6.3	A Holistic, Actor-Centred Conception of the WTM Process	195
6.4	A Complex Systems Conception of WTM.....	206
6.5	When Static Policy Meets a Dynamic Policy Environment: Some Concluding Comments.....	222
Chapter Seven – From Understanding Complexity to Addressing Complexity: Building Resilience into WTM Planning Practice.....		225
7.1	Avoiding a ‘Blanket Approach’	225
7.2	A Resilience Framework for WTM Planning Practice.....	227
7.3	Resilient WTM Planning Practice for Dynamic Policy Environments	242
Chapter Eight – Conclusion		244
References.....		251
Appendix A: Participant Organisation Profiles.....		266
Appendix B: Participant Policy Makers and Planners Profiles.....		267
Appendix C: Interview Guides		268
Appendix D: Survey		272
Appendix E: Background Data: Employee Survey.....		285

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Figure 1.1	Thesis Logic and Structure.....	13
Figure 2.1	Common Conception of the WTM Planning Process.....	36
Figure 2.2	Staged Development of WTM.....	37
Figure 3.1	A Conceptual Model of Travel Behaviour.....	66
Figure 4.1	Map of Sydney.....	77
Figure 4.2	Map of Recruitment Areas.....	78
Figure 4.3	Participant Groups and Research Objectives.....	83
Figure 5.1	Measures to Encourage a Shift from Solo Occupant Car Use.....	114
Figure 5.2	Mode Choice Preferences under a WTM Programme.....	116
Figure 5.3	Company Car Use by Organisation.....	118
Figure 5.4	Parking Payment Arrangements.....	119
Figure 5.5	Awareness of Workplace Infrastructure for Cycling and Walking....	124
Figure 5.6	Mode Choice for Business Travel.....	129
Figure 5.7	Reasons for Car Travel for Business Trips.....	130
Figure 5.8	Mode Choice Aggregates and Willingness to Shift Mode by Age....	139
Figure 5.9	Mode Choice Aggregates.....	146
Figure 5.10	Reasons for Mode Choice – Car Drivers.....	146
Figure 5.11	Reasons for Mode Choice – Public Transport Users.....	147
Figure 5.12	Reasons for Mode Choice – Cyclists and Pedestrians.....	147
Figure 5.13	Trip Chaining Activities of Drivers for Trips To and From Work....	148
Figure 5.14	Factors Preventing Adoption of Alternative Modes.....	150
Figure 5.15	Comments.....	154
Figure 5.16	Mode Choice Aggregates by Area.....	170
Figure 5.17	Journey Distance by Area.....	170
Figure 5.18	Access to Free Parking by Area.....	171
Figure 5.19	Comparison of Organisations – Kappa v Lambda.....	173
Figure 5.20	Comparison of Organisations – Alpha v Gamma.....	173
Figure 6.1	Managerial Filter.....	193
Figure 6.2	WTM Process Framework.....	198
Figure 6.3	Actors in a WTM Process.....	204
Figure 6.4	System Model.....	207
Figure 6.5	Fundamental Characteristics of Complex Systems.....	219

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1	TDM Strategies and Approaches.....	17
Table 2.2	WTM Measures.....	39
Table 5.1	List of Participants and Organisations by Area or Sector.....	95
Table 6.1	Managers' Perspectives on WTM Measures.....	191
Table 7.1	Principles for a Resilient WTM Planning Practice.....	233

ABSTRACT

The way we travel matters. The transport mode we choose enables us to fulfil our needs and meet our daily requirements as we move from place to place. The car, as the dominant transport mode in most cities internationally, affords us considerable mobility and flexibility. It allows us to moderate spatial and temporal limitations in carrying out our travel routines, thus providing a functional and convenient way of moving about. However, the negative consequences of excessive car use also matter. Car dependence in cities gives rise to various environmental, economic, human health and social implications, requiring urban planners and policy makers to consider ways to address these negative externalities.

In Sydney, an increasingly populous, multicentric and car dependent city, urban planning policy continues to focus on improved public transport infrastructure and service delivery as means to achieving car reduction objectives—hence demonstrating a predisposition to supply-side initiatives. Initiatives that seek to reduce demand for travel, including Workplace Travel Management (WTM), have received considerably less attention, despite being embraced by strategic planning frameworks for more than a decade. WTM incorporates a system of policy interventions aimed at travel behaviour modification of employees within trip generating organisations (workplaces) to reduce, or increase the efficiency of, car use for journeys to, from and at work. As such, it offers a possible approach to reducing commuting and work-related travel that may contribute to broader planning policies seeking to address excessive car use in urban environments.

This thesis considers the potential development and implementation of a centrally administered, citywide WTM programme in Sydney. It explores the domains in which such a programme would operate, and garners the perspectives of primary system actors within these domains as to opportunities for, and barriers to, more comprehensive WTM planning practice in Sydney. The thesis aspires to a deeper understanding of the WTM policy environment and the diversity and interdependence of actors and their contexts—as these factors ultimately determine programme operation and outcomes. This thesis reveals a highly complex policy environment for WTM and proposes a resilience framework as a means to better understand and negotiate that complexity.