

THE CATHOLIC COMMUNITY IN NEW SOUTH WALES

1788 - 1815:

A CHURCH WITHOUT CLERGY

Volume I

Joseph A. Morley B. A. (Hons.) Macquarie

Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

School of History, Philosophy and Politics

Macquarie University

February 1997

CONTENTS

Page

I certify that this work has not been submitted for a higher
degree to another university or institution.

J. A. Morley.

CONTENTS

	Page
Acknowledgements:	ii
Illustrations:	v
Abbreviations:	vii
Abstract:	viii
Introduction:	1
Prologue:	26
Chapter One: A Church Without Clergy	32
Chapter Two: Early Catholic Historiography 1788 - 1815:	48
A Chapter Of Errors	
Chapter Three: The Catholics Of New South Wales	105
Portrait Of A Community	
Chapter Four: The Cultural Baggage of English and Irish Convicts	137
Chapter Five: The Great Irish Fear: The Irish In New South Wales	156
Chapter Six: Compelled To Worship?	184
Chapter Seven: Who Was Father Walsh?	217
Chapter Eight: The First Australian Catholic Confessors	236
Chapter Nine: The Convict Priests	268
Chapter Ten: Myths And Legends	351
Chapter Eleven: Whose Responsibility?	424
Conclusion:	443
Bibliography:	446

Appendices in Volume II.

ERRATA

Page 5: 1st line: Delete second 'r' from 'Jeremiah.'

Page 12: 2nd line from bottom: Read 'periodic' in place of 'iodic.'

Pages 14 - 15: For 'Bennett' read 'Bennet.'

Page 38: Last line: Delete 'which' and replace with 'this.'

Page 47: last line: Delete 'the.'

Page 51: Line 3: Delete '*The*' from title of Waldersee's book.

Page 94: 2nd line: Close quote after 'escaped.'

Page 126: Line 6: For 'Nichloas,' read 'Nicholas.'

Page 137: Line 3, paragraph 2: Insert 'not' between 'were' and 'any.'

Page 179: Add 'were' after 'who' in last line before the quotation.

Page 194: Line 4: Insert 'The' before "Commisioning.'

Page 218: Line 1: For 'Catholic', read 'Catholics.'

Page 221: second last line: Delete first 'him who.'

Page 226: Last line: Delete 'this thesis.'

Page 236: 1st paragraph, 2nd line: For 'th' read 'the.'

Page 238: Footnote: Line 12: For 'st.' read 'St.' Line 25: Insert 'of ' before 'Conolly.'

Page 241: Line 24: For 'hey', read 'they.'

Page 254: Line 3 from bottom: Delete bracket in front. of 'Senior', and insert it in front of 'another.'

Page 288: Last line: Insert ['incriminated'] after 'criminated.' Footnote 24: For '203 - 210', read '209 -210'.

Page 302: 4th line ,paragraph 2; Read 'Portland' in place of 'Hobart'.

Page 302: 10th line, paragraph 2; Delete 'requested Hobart give him instructions.'
Read: 'sought instructions.'

Page 304: lines 4 & 5, ist paragraph.: Delete bracketed words.

Page 320: Line 8: Insert ' [Gaol] ' before 'Delivery.'

Page 353: Line 9 in first quotation: Read "Tierra" in place of 'Terra.'

Page 396: Last paragraph, line 1: For 'aunt' read 'mother'.

Page 461 : In fifth Ullathorne entry: For 'Wilson', read 'Willson.'

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First and foremost among the many to whom I owe thanks for guidance, assistance and encouragement, is my supervisor, Dr.T.G.Parsons, of Macquarie University. Then comes a long list of most willing and cooperative people. Not necessarily in order of degree of assistance, they are: Monsignor. Charles Burns, Archivist Vatican Secret Archives; Miss Sara Joynes, London; Father Ian Dickie, Archivist Westminster Diocesan Archives; Father Ralph Wiltgen SVD, Rome (later U.S.A); Associate Professor Bruce Kercher, Macquarie University School of Law; Dr John Kilcullen, Macquarie University; Professor John Walmsley, Macquarie University; Dr Dennis Phillips, (formerly Macquarie University); Professor Duncan Waterson, Macquarie University; Professor A. Cousins, Macquarie University; Dr Raymond Nobbs, Macquarie University; Dr Leighton Frappell, Macquarie University; Dr Trevor McLaughlin, Macquarie University; Dr Barrie O'Dwyer, (formerly Macquarie University); James Hamilton (retired), Ian Sargent, and Robin Walsh of Macquarie University Library; Julie Playle, Macquarie University Law Library; Tim Slocombe, Macquarie Library Inter-Library Loan Office; Father Edmund Campion, Associate Professor of History, Catholic Institute, Sydney; Dr. Garth Thomas, Public Record Office, Kew, London; Professor A. G. L. Shaw, Melbourne; Professor P.J. O'Farrell, University of New South Wales; Archivists of Propaganda Fide, Rome; Sister Peter Damien, Sydney, (for translations); Ms. L. Craven Curator, Royal Commission For Historical Monuments, London; Ms Diana Rhodes, Dixon Gallery; Ms.Jennifer Broomhead, Mitchell Library; Hans Arns, formerly Librarian of Veech Library, Manly and Strathfield, Sydney; Father John Keane OFM, Archivist Franciscan Provincial Office, Waverley, Sydney; Father Paul Collins MSC; Father Patrick Conlan OFM, St Francis', Cork, Ireland; Mr Gregory O'Connor, Archivist National Archives, Dublin; Paul Grogan (and others) Student Archivist, Venerable English College, Rome; Father Michael Clifton, St Joseph's,

Colliers Wood, London; Bishop Francis Walmsley, Bishopric of the Forces, Farnborough, Hampshire, England; Father Petropc Howell, Assistant Archivist Archdiocese of Birmingham, England; Father Brian Maher, Bungendore, NSW; Miss Rosemary Rental, Catholic Record Society, London; The Abbott and Dom Aidan Bellinger OSB, Downside, England; Mr L Fontana, Southsea, Hants, England; Father F Grannell OFM, Librarian Franciscan House of Studies, Kiliney, Dublin; Father Leonard Boyle OP, Vatican Librarian; M. Alain Bourat, Musee de la Marine, Paris; Rev Harold Perkins, Burwood, Victoria; Father David OFM, Rector Irish Franciscan College (St Isadore's), Rome; Sister E. Cavanagh, Daughters of Charity Headquarters, Paris; Susan M. Swasta, Assistant Curator, William L. Clements Library, Michigan, U. S. A.; S. M. Dixon, Archivist Kent County Council; Dr. M. Roe, University of Tasmania; Father G. Holt, S.J., Archivist Jesuit Provincial House, London; D. J. Johnson, Clerk of Records, House of Lords; Father T. Southerwood, Bellerive, Tasmania; Father D. C. Sheedy, Archivist, Archdiocese of Dublin; Father H. Fenning O.P., Archivist Dominican Archives, Dublin; Father Anselm Cramer, OSB., Librarian Ampleforth College, York; Professor R. Reece, Murdoch University, Perth; Father J. Dougherty, Tribunal of the Catholic Church, Sydney; Dr. L. D. McIntosh, Librarian, Joint Theological Library, Ormond College, Melbourne; Stephen Barlow, Land Titles Office of New South Wales; D. Murphy, Parliamentary Counsel to the Parliament of New South Wales; R. G. Grove, Clerk of the New South Wales Legislative Assembly; R. Baker, New South Wales Parliamentary Library; Father T. Brennan, Archivist, Diocese of Wexford, Ireland; Father W. Brieven, Archivist, Archdiocese of Brussels; C. McLaughlin, National Library of Scotland; Ms C. Murphy, Librarian, Wexford County Library; Mrs C. O'Flaherty, National Library of Ireland; Father J. Meltzer, Archivist, Propaganda Fide (Vatican) Archives; Father T. Boland, Banyo, Queensland; Dr. A. T. Yarwood, Sydney; Miss N. Jonkers, Librarian *The Catholic Weekly*, Sydney; Justice J. Macken, Sydney; Dr. A. Frost, Latrobe University, Victoria; Librarian and Archivist of the United Grand Lodge of New South Wales; G.C. Cumming, Director of Research, The Masonic Historical Society of New South Wales; Father M. McCarthy, Parish Priest

Crossabeg, Wexford, Ireland; Professor G. Bolton, Edith Cowan University, Perth; Sister M. Quinlan, Archivist, Daughters of Charity, Sydney; Sister Judith Greville, Archivist, Daughters of Charity, Mill Hill, London; Ms.S. Bird, Archivist, Northumberland County Council; Monsignor D. J. Stewart, Lismore; Father Ian Waters, Diocesan Historical Commission, Melbourne; Father Paul Chandler, O.CARM. Melbourne; Father Fergus, Farrell, Archivist of the Diocese of Ossory, Eire; Mr John Bennett, Sydney; Father F. J. Turner S.J., Archivist, Stonyhurst College, England; Father. Richard Lennan S.M., The Catholic Institute, Sydney; Staffs of Macquarie University Library, The Archives Office of New South Wales, especially Gail Davis, Angela Kavuzlu, Laraine Tate, Fabian Lo Schiavo and Martyn Killion; Mitchell Library, State Library, Fisher Library (University of Sydney), University of New South Wales Library, The National Library of Ireland; The National Library of Scotland. Dr. Wing Cheung for reading the manuscript; fellow students at Macquarie University, and friends, for encouragement. My family for their forbearance; for her computer tuition, my daughter Dominique, and for her assistance with proofing, my daughter Louise.

ILLUSTRATIONS

	Following Page
Governor King's Order for Muster of Catholics in 1803	7
De Quiros' Memorial To Pope Clement VIII	26
De Quiros Chart of the Pacific 1598	
Memorial of De Silva To Pope Urban VIII	28
Father Riccio's Map of Terra Australis 1676	30
Vatican Council II In Session	37
Vicar-General William Bernard Ullathorne	68
Title Page of Dean Kenny's <i>History</i>	75
Sydney Cove in 1788. watercolour by Lieutenant William Bradley	77
Cardinal Moran	79
Dr Eris O'Brien	86
Michael Dwyer and Land Grants to Dwyer and his companions	122
Female " <i>Register</i> " attributed to Marsden	
Specimen of Marsden's handwriting	
Samuel Marsden's handwriting (1)	132
Samuel Marsden's handwriting (2)	
A mob ransacks a house during the 1780 Gordon Riots	166
Judge Advocate David Collins	168
First Fleet enters Port Jackson, January 26, 1788	171
Governor Phillip toasts success to the colony	
Governor Phillip	172
Governor Phillip's subscription of the Test Act <i>Declaration</i>	
Reverend Samuel Marsden	177
Original Draft of Governor Phillip's <i>Instructions</i>	188
Amendments To Draft of Phillip's <i>Instructions</i>	
The Instructions Issued To Governor Phillip	
Reverend Richard Johnson	195
Governor Hunter	206
Governor Macquarie	209
Lord Sydney	218

	Following Page
Letter from Father Walsh to Lord Sydney and Address on Father Walsh's Letter	219
Bandyleg Walk Southwark - Location of Father Walsh's chapel	232
Governor Phillip	244
Government House, Sydney 1791	
Petition to Governor Phillip by Catholics 1792	
Land grants to three of the 1792 petitioners	
Grave of John Butler at Botany	262
Convict Priest Father O'Neil	274
Governor King	305
Governor King's 1803 <i>Proclamation</i>	307
Original of 1672 Test Act	310
The 1672 Test Act (2)	
Father Dixon at Vinegar Hill Rebellion , March 1804	332
Petition to Propaganda Fide seeking faculties for Father Dixon	335
Appointment of Dixon as Prefect Apostolic of New Holland	338
Father Dixon's signature on Address to Governor Bligh	343
Governor Bligh	
Grave of Father Dixon	349
Cardinal Moran	352
Gladstone (Port Curtis) on the Queensland coast	355
Jean-Francois Galaup de Laperouse	365
Louis XVI discussing plans with Laperouse	
Grave of Father Receveur OFM at Laperouse	366
Reverend Richard Johnson's church	369
Father Jeremiah O'Flynn	393
William Davis' House	398
James Dempsey's grave (now in Botany Cemetery)	399
Father John Joseph Therry	402
Grave of William Davis at Botany	421
Pope Pius VI	439
Cartoon lampooning Pius VI	
Pope Pius VII at Napoleon's coronation	440

ABBREVIATIONS

AJCP: Australian Joint Copying Project.

AONSW: Archives Office of New South Wales.

HRA: Historical Records of Australia.

HRNSW: Historical Records of New South Wales.

PRO: Public Record Office (London).

ML: Mitchell Library

JHGSV: Journal of the Royal Geographical Society (Victoria).

JRAHS: Journal of the Royal Australian Historical Society

THESIS ABSTRACT

This thesis is a study of the Catholic lay community in New South Wales between 1788 and 1815. It contends that the community was a Church without clergy; that its members *were* the Catholic Church in New South Wales. It seeks to provide a clear, coherent account of early Australian Catholicism, based on a firm documentary base.

In almost all previous histories of the Catholic Church in Australia, little or no attention is paid to the role of lay Catholics in the foundation of the Church. Because documentary or narrative records were and are not readily accessible, historians, including Cardinal Moran,¹ neglected or dismissed the history of the lay Church in a few pages. They consigned it to the "too hard" basket of history. Others, such as Kenny,² ignored the laity and triumphalised the institutional Church which was not established in the colony until 1820.

The thesis provides documentary evidence, some for the first time in Australian Catholic historiography; and makes new appraisals of material previously published but lightly passed over in Catholic histories. Research was conducted in local archives and libraries, and in the United Kingdom,

¹ P.F. Moran: *History of the Catholic Church in Australasia* (Sydney 1895).

² J. Kenny: *A History of the Commencement and Progress of Catholicity in Australia Up To the Year 1840* (Sydney 1886).

Ireland, Europe and the United States, particularly in the Vatican archives. The results not only break new ground but hopefully will inspire future research.

The fundamental human rights of liberty of conscience, of worship and association, denied to the Catholic laity, by the Anglican establishment; a real evaluation of Father Thomas Walsh, the first Catholic priest to volunteer to minister to the Catholics of New South Wales (his request was denied or disregarded), and who was labelled by one Australian Catholic historian as "an obscure priest;" the inflated and triumphalised narratives of the 'Convict Priests', transported from Ireland (patriotically referred to by some Catholic writers as 'martyrs', as 'apostles', or as 'missionaries'); myths and legends (Cardinal Moran's claim that Portuguese navigator De Quiros discovered the east coast of Australia, and that his chaplains celebrated the first Mass on Australian soil; the myth of 'the convict nun,' the mythical First Fleet convict priest), fostered to bolster the role of the institutional Church, the claims that Catholics were flogged for refusal to attend Anglican church services; these and other matters, are dealt with. A vignetted portrait of the Catholic community of 1788 - 1815, dispelling false claims about its composition, is also produced.

Finally, an explanation is provided for the neglect by English and Irish bishops and the seeming disregard by Vatican authorities of the spiritual needs of the Catholic community in New South Wales in the foundation years.